A Comparative Study of Textbooks In Citizenship For High School.

Trellie Albert James

Fort Hays Kansas State College

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholars.fhsu.edu/theses

Part of the Education Commons

Recommended Citation


https://scholars.fhsu.edu/theses/272

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at FHSU Scholars Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of FHSU Scholars Repository.
A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF TEXTBOOKS IN CITIZENSHIP

FOR HIGH SCHOOLS

being

A Thesis presented to the Graduate Faculty of the Fort Hays Kansas State College in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Science

by

Trellie Albert James, A. B.

The College of Emporia

Date Sept. 15, 1938 Approved

Robert J. McGrath

Mejer Professor

Acting Chairman Graduate Council
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The writer wishes to thank all of those who evaluated his check-list of criteria for scoring textbooks in citizenship for high schools, or who made suggestions relative to this investigation and study. Also, he wishes to express his appreciation for the suggestions made by Dr. Robert T. McGrath, his major professor, under whose guidance this study was made.
| CONTENT |
|------------------|---|
| ACKNOWLEDGMENT  | ---11 |
| CONTENT         | ---111 |
| PART I. THE USE OF CRITERIA IN TEXTBOOK SELECTION | ---1 |
| CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION | ---1 |
| The Textbook Problem | ---1 |
| Studies in Textbook Selection and Comparison | ---3 |
| Studies of Textbooks in Civics | ---4 |
| CHAPTER II. THE ESTABLISHMENT AND EVALUATION OF CRITERIA | ---6 |
| The Method of Procedure | ---6 |
| The Evaluation of the Check-List of Criteria | ---7 |
| PART II. THE SELECTION OF TEXTBOOKS FOR COMPARISON | ---9 |
| CHAPTER III. THE SELECTION OF FOUR TEXTBOOKS FROM AMONG TEN TEXTBOOKS IN CITIZENSHIP | ---9 |
| The Method of Selection | ---9 |
| Interpreting the Score of the Cost Item | ---11 |
| PART III. THE COMPARISON OF TEXTBOOKS BY THE USE OF A DETAILED CHECK-LIST | ---15 |
| CHAPTER IV. THE COMPARISON OF FOUR TEXTBOOKS | ---15 |
| The Method of Comparison | ---15 |
| The Method of Evaluating the Scores of the Detailed Check-List Which Was Used to Compare the Four Texts | ---15 |
Findings from Table III------------------17

PART IV. THE COMPARISON OF TEXTBOOKS BY COMPARING THE TEXTS WITH EACH OTHER--------------------------19

CHAPTER V. THE COMPARISON OF FOUR TEXTBOOKS BY COMPARING THE TEXTS WITH EACH OTHER----------------------19

The Method of Comparison--------------------------19

The Mechanical Features---------------------------21

The Authors of the Texts--------------------------23

The Comparison of the Texts from the Standpoint of the Publisher, Recency of Publication, and Cost to Students--------------------------25

A Comparison of the Content from the Standpoint of the Divisions of the Text--------------------------26

The Preface or Foreword--------------------------26

The Table of Content-----------------------------26

The Author’s Page to the Teachers-------------------27

The Author’s Page to the Students-------------------28

Sufficient Amount and Scope of Subject Matter-----28

Illustrations in the Texts------------------------30

Charts, Graphs, Maps, Diagrams, and Tables--------31

Summaries of the Texts-----------------------------32

References and Bibliographies----------------------32

Workbooks and Achievement Tests-------------------33

Suggestions to the Class---------------------------34
Questions for Thought and Discussion------------36
The Appendix, Glossary, Index, and Teacher's Manual-----------------------------37
The Organization and Presentation of Subject Matter in Textbook, Number B--------38
The Organization and Presentation of Subject Matter in Textbook, Number C--------40
The Organization and Presentation of Subject Matter in Textbook, Number D--------42
The Organization and Presentation of Subject Matter in Textbook, Number E--------44
Subject Matter Material Contained in the Four Texts---------------------------------47
CONCLUSION---------------------------------------------------------------57
APPENDIX A---------------------------------------------------------------60
APPENDIX B---------------------------------------------------------------124
APPENDIX C---------------------------------------------------------------136
BIBLIOGRAPHY-------------------------------------------------------------139
PART I

THE USE OF CRITERIA IN TEXTBOOK SELECTION

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The Textbook Problem

The textbook is the chief medium of instruction, and the textbook problem is of interest to editors and publishers as well as to educators and students. Thus far, there has been no standardized method of evaluating texts. Textbooks are frequently judged in toto by the evaluator scanning through the pages without reference to established criteria, but a movement to devise a method for comparing textbooks is gaining momentum.

The problem of this thesis is to make a comparative study of textbooks to be used in citizenship classes in high schools. It consists of two parts: first, the establishment of a measuring scale to be used for selecting the texts and, second, the comparison of the texts.

The method consisted of setting up a check-list containing one thousand points to be used in selecting
the texts. These texts were then compared by two other methods: first, by checking the texts according to a more detailed check-list than the one used in selecting the texts and, second, by comparing the texts with each other.

The check-list used for selecting the texts contained five major divisions and a number of subdivisions. The major divisions are as follows: (1) mechanical features, (2) author, (3) publisher, (4) content, from the standpoint of divisions of the text, and (5) subject matter.

The first method of comparing the texts was by the use of a more detailed check-list used in selecting the texts; the second method consisted of a comparison of the texts with each other on the basis of the check-list designed for this comparison and explained as follows: (1) mechanical features, (2) authors, (3) publisher, recency of publication and cost to students, (4) preface or foreword, (5) table of content, (6) author's page to the teacher, (7) author's page to the student, (8) sufficient amount and scope of subject matter, (9) illustrations, (10) charts, graphs, maps, diagrams and tables, (11) summaries, (12) references and bibliographies, (13) workbooks and achievement tests, (14) suggestions to the class, (15) questions for thought and discussion,
(16) appendices, glossaries, indexes and teacher's manual,
(17) the organization and presentation of subject matter,
(18) and the subject matter, itself.

Studies in Textbook Selection
and Comparison

Theses have been written relative to textbook selection, comparison or analysis by Kronenberg\(^1\), Metter\(^2\) and Maguire\(^3\). Also, material has been written on the subject by Jensen\(^4\), Rader\(^5\), Fuller\(^6\), and Herriott, Fuller

---


In 1921 the Ohio State Department of Education made a study of textbooks and, since that time, the D. C. Heath Book Company, the Houghton Mifflin Book Company, and Ginn and Company financed a survey made by the National Society for the Study of Education relative to the typography of textbooks.

Studies of Textbooks in Civics

Although numerous studies and comparisons of textbooks have been made, it appears that there have been relatively few studies made in the field of civics; and the writer has found no reference to a comparative study of textbooks in citizenship for high schools. The following have made studies in civics or community civics: Cobb, Dalke


8. See Inquiries Concerning Comparative Studies of Textbooks in Citizenship for High Schools in Appendix B.


CHAPTER II

THE ESTABLISHMENT AND EVALUATION OF CRITERIA

The Method of Procedure

After considerable reading, study and preparation, the writer compiled a check-list of criteria for scoring textbooks in citizenship for high schools. First, he made a list of all the criteria suggested by authors in the literature that he surveyed; second, he chose the criteria from the list that seemed applicable to the study and, third, he added other criteria which appeared necessary for the evaluation of citizenship texts. Next, he organized these criteria into five major divisions with numerous subdivisions. Upon the final completion of the check-list, he sent it to Dr. Segel, Educational Committant, United States Office of Education, the National Education Association, the Board of Education, District of Columbia, and to a number of state departments of education, state education associations, offices of city superintendents, county superintendents, college teachers, high school teachers, publishers and laymen. Each of these was asked to score the check-list upon the bases of one thousand points; and those who so kindly
evaluated the check-list, or sent recommendations or check-lists of their own, are listed in Appendix C. Also, the letter of explanation, which was sent with the check-list to those who were asked to evaluate it, and the check-list itself may be found in Appendix A.

The Evaluation of the Check-List of Criteria

After receiving the replies from those who had evaluated the check-list, the criteria for scoring textbooks in citizenship for high schools was evaluated further by the investigator averaging the number of points awarded to each item by the individuals of each group to whom the check-lists were sent. This gave each item an average score for each group. Then the writer averaged the group averages of each item and used the average of group averages in the selection of texts. The evaluation of the check-list is shown in Table I in Appendix A.

In some instances some of those who scored the criteria did not score all of the items in the subdivisions; and the absence of such scores caused the total of the average scored in some subdivisions (Table I, Column 8) to exceed the total average score of the main divisions. In such instances the writer found the per cent that the total of the average scores in the subdivisions exceeded the total average score of the main divisions and subtracted
that per cent of excess from each of the average scores in the subdivisions. That is, in Column 8 of Table I, he subtracted the per cent of excess from the average score of each item in the subdivision. Frequently the average score contained a fraction. These were carried to two places; but to avoid the use of scores which contained fractions, the decimals which were less than five-tenths or above were considered as one.
PART II

THE SELECTION OF TEXTBOOKS FOR COMPARISON

CHAPTER III

THE SELECTION OF FOUR TEXTBOOKS FROM AMONG TEN TEXTBOOKS IN CITIZENSHIP

The Method of Selection

The next step in this study was the selection of the four best textbooks from among ten textbooks in citizenship for minute comparison. Four texts were chosen for comparison because, for practical purposes, four seemed to be a sufficient number to furnish most, if not all, of the points of excellency which are contained in all of the texts. On the other hand, the comparison of two or three textbooks only would increase the possibility of eliminating a text which might be more worthwhile than the evaluator thought. In order to score the ten textbooks which were considered, each textbook was checked by each item in the final average of the evaluated criteria which is shown in Column 8 of Table I in Appendix A, and a definite number of points was awarded to each item in each text. These findings are tabulated
in Table II in Appendix A. This table shows the score for each textbook considered and the per cent of correlation between the score of each text and its possible score, which is one thousand points. After the ten textbooks were checked by the items found in Column 8 of Table I, they were ranked according to their respective symbols in order of excellence and the four highest ranking textbooks were chosen for minute comparison. The symbols were arranged according to their respective scores and per cent of correlation in the following order: No. 2, score, 892; per cent, 89.2%; No. 5, score, 765; per cent, 76.5%; No. 10, score, 761; per cent 76.1%; No. 9, score, 739; per cent, 73.9%; No. 6, score, 715; per cent, 71.5%; No. 7, score, 710; per cent, 71%; No. 1, score 700; per cent 70%; No. 4, score 641; per cent, 64.1%; No. 8, score, 625; per cent, 62.5%; No. 3, score, 569; per cent, 56.9%. The textbooks corresponding to the first four symbols were chosen for comparison. Textbooks, Number 2 refers to Building Citizenship by R. O. Hughes; Number 5 refers to Civics Through Problems by James B. Edmonson and Arthur Dondineau; Number 10 represents My Worth to the World by Louise I Capen and D. Montfort Melchior; and Number 9 refers to The Life and Work of the Citizen by Howard C. Hill. These findings do not indicate that the textbooks ranking below the most superior text are not of value,
but the findings led the investigator to believe that the
most superior are more valuable for textbook use although
the others are of value. No. 7 and No. 8 are written
above the age-level of students who ordinarily study
citizenship in high schools; however, it is the writer's
opinion that these books are superior texts for older
high school students of government. He would recommend
either of them for use in a course in Constitution or
American Government rather than for a course in
Citizenship. No. 8 contains more facts relative to
government than No. 7, but No. 7 contains some explanation
of each part of the federal constitution in simple
language. As a whole No. 7 is more easily understood.

Interpreting the Score of the Cost Item

The evaluated criteria provides thirty-four points
for the cost item; but it was necessary to devise a
method for interpreting the thirty-four points in terms
of the cost of each textbook, and the following method
was used:

The total cost of the ten textbooks considered
($13.14) was divided by the total number of points (6,869)
of all of the texts, not counting the score for the cost.
This division gave .001912 which is the average cost per
point of excellency. This quotient was then multiplied
by the number of points of each textbook in order to find the amount of money that each textbook should cost upon the basis of the average cost per point of all textbooks considered. The Actual cost (publisher's price) of each textbook was then compared with the amount that each textbook was worth, and the per cent was multiplied by the score of the cost item (34) of each test. In case the publisher's price did not exceed the actual value of the text, the cost item was scored thirty-four.

Example:

$13.14 equals the total cost of all textbooks considered.

6,869 equals the total number of points of all the textbooks considered, not counting the score for the cost item.

34 equals the score of a book whose price does not exceed its actual value as determined by multiplying the number of points of the text by the cost per point of excellency.

866 equals the number of points of excellency of textbook No. 2.

$13.14 equals .001912.

\[
\frac{6,869}{0.001912} = 866
\]

.001912 times 866 equals $1.655 or $1.66, which is the amount that the textbook is worth.
$2.07 equals the publisher's price of the textbook.

$2.07 equals 1.2468 or 125%. That is, the publisher's price is 25% more than the value of the text. 100% - 25% equals 75%; therefore the cost item of the text is 75% of 34, which is 25.5 or 26. In case the publisher's price did not exceed the actual value, the cost item was scored 34.

The symbols for the textbooks considered, together with the number of points in each textbook (not counting the cost-item score), the publisher's price, and the cost-item score are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Textbook Symbol</th>
<th>Points in Textbook</th>
<th>Publisher's Price</th>
<th>Cost-Item Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. 1</td>
<td>666</td>
<td>$1.20</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 2</td>
<td>866</td>
<td>$2.07</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 3</td>
<td>636</td>
<td>$1.05</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 4</td>
<td>607</td>
<td>$.92</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 5</td>
<td>731</td>
<td>$1.25</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 6</td>
<td>681</td>
<td>$1.24</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 7</td>
<td>749</td>
<td>$1.90</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 8</td>
<td>645</td>
<td>$1.39</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textbook Symbol</td>
<td>Points in Textbook</td>
<td>Publisher's Price</td>
<td>Cost-Item Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 9</td>
<td>705</td>
<td>$1.20</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 10</td>
<td>709</td>
<td>$1.17</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART III

THE COMPARISON OF TEXTBOOKS BY THE USE OF A DETAILED CHECK-LIST

CHAPTER IV

THE COMPARISON OF FOUR TEXTBOOKS

The Method of Comparison

Building Citizenship by R. O. Hughes, Civics Through Problems by James B. Edmonson and Arthur Dondineau, My Worth to the World by Louise I. Capen and D. Montfort Melchior, and The Life and Work of the Citizen by Howard C. Hill were the four texts chosen for comparison. The comparison was made by scoring each of the four textbooks according to a more detailed check-list of criteria (Table III) than the check-list used in the selection of the four textbooks chosen for comparison (Table II) and, also, by comparing the textbooks with each other.

The Method of Evaluating the Scores of the Detailed Check-List Which Was Used to Compare the Four Texts

The detailed check-list, together with the score of
the four textbooks compared, is shown in Table III of Appendix A. It is the same as Table I of Appendix A except that a part of the major divisions have been subdivided further in order to render them more detailed. All of the scores in major divisions I, II, III, and IV, and the scores for subdivisions 1 and 2 of V-A, were evaluated by those to whom the check-list was sent. Also, the scores for the main divisions in the detailed check-list (Table III) were evaluated by the same individuals. The remainder of major division V-A and major division V-B were subdivided further and evaluated by the writer; but his evaluation of these subdivisions were made upon the basis of the evaluation of the major divisions which had been previously evaluated by those to whom the check-lists were sent. According to the evaluated criteria for subdivisions, Nos. 3 and 5 under V-A of Table I were awarded a total of 110 points by the evaluators. For Table III the writer subdivided these two subdivisions (Nos. 3 and 5) into five parts and divided one of these five parts into four others. These five divisions appeared to merit about the same score and, therefore, were scored by the writer accordingly; but since one of these five parts was divided into four lesser subdivisions the writer scored these four parts with the total score of twenty-two points which was awarded to each of the five
divisions. Major division V-B of Table I was awarded 116 points by the evaluators. The writer subdivided V-B into thirty points to form Table III and awarded the 116 points to the thirty subdivisions as he considered that the criteria merited.

Findings from Table III

In Table III the letter, B, is used as a symbol to represent Building Citizenship by R. O. Hughes; the letter, C, refers to The Life and Work of the Citizen by Howard C. Hill; the letter, D, symbolizes Civics Through Problems by James B. Edmonson and Arthur Dondineau; and the letter, E, refers to My Worth to the World by Louise I. Capen and D. Montfort Melchior.

By the use of the detailed criteria in Table III, the minute comparison reveals that the textbook designated by symbol B is the most worthwhile textbook in citizenship for high schools. The second most valuable text is designed by symbol D, and the next in order of superiority are represented by symbols E and C respectively. The scores and per cent of correlation of these four textbooks are as follows: Textbook B, score 889.5; per cent 88.95%; textbook D, score 760; per cent, 76%; textbook E, score, 742; per cent, 74.2%; textbook C, score 728; per cent 72.8%. These findings do not imply
that the textbooks ranking below the first are not worthwhile texts. In fact, textbook C is a highly desirable text in several respects and the scores for textbooks D and E are nearly equal.
PART IV

THE COMPARISON OF TEXTBOOKS BY COMPARING
THE TEXTS WITH EACH OTHER

CHAPTER V

THE COMPARISON OF FOUR TEXTBOOKS BY COMPARING
THE TEXTS WITH EACH OTHER

The Method of Comparison

The comparison of these four texts is made by comparing the texts with each other according to the detailed criteria which is shown in Table III. This check-list of criteria is divided into five major divisions and is subdivided into eighty-four others. The five major divisions are as follows: first, Mechanical Features; second, Author Criteria; third, Publisher, Recency of Publication and Cost; fourth, Content from the Standpoint of Divisions of the Text; and the fifth major division is divided into V-A and V-B, which represent the organization and presentation of subject matter and the subject matter, itself.

The mechanical features include the size, binding, paper and print of the text; but these are subdivided
further into a total of twelve parts. The author criteria consists of the authoritativeness of the author; and the criteria of the publisher, recency of publication, and cost to students form three other parts. The content criteria, considered from the standpoint of the divisions of the text, is divided into twenty-five subdivisions, such as the preface or foreword, glossary, index, list of illustrations, appendix, questions for thought and discussion, suggestions to the class for writing citizenship news for school publications et cetera. The first part of the fifth major division (V-A) deals with the organization and presentation of the subject matter. This is divided into twelve subdivisions, including (1) the organization of subject matter relative to the amount, location, scope, and sequence of units, topics, questions for thought and discussion et cetera; (2) presentation of subject matter by beginning with materials with which the student is acquainted, by verbal illustrations to relate the subject matter to everyday activities; style of language, including clearness, conciseness, effectiveness, choice and difficulty of words; presentation of subject matter in interesting methods, and the accuracy of facts presented. The second part of the fifth major division (V-B) deals with the subject matter, itself. This is subdivided into thirty parts and refers to the subject
matter presented, such as (1) the meaning of American citizenship, including duties and responsibilities as well as privileges and immunities; (2) community life, community spirit and community organization, including community development and the stages of early community life; (3) our American heritage: racial, national, political, social, and economic; (4) good citizenship in the home, in the school, and in the community, including the promotion of health, recreation, the wise use of leisure, and ethical character; (5) the necessity and purpose of government; (6) the qualities of a good American citizen, including health, tolerance, sympathy, justice, responsibility, culture, large-group consciousness, moral behavior, fellowship, socialized attitudes, social, economic, religious, industrial and political ideals; respect for the opinions of others, and twenty-four other subdivisions.

The Mechanical Features

The study of these texts shows more similarity in mechanical features than in many other respects. Numbers B and D are, perhaps, more nearly perfect in size than Numbers C and E, but they are all of a convenient size. The bindings are all durable and are reasonably attractive, Number C is the most attractive although the color is
doubtlessly a factor in making the lettering and design effective. Number B ranks as a close second in attractiveness; Number D is third; and Number E is the least attractive of the four texts. Numbers C and D are, perhaps, equal from the standpoint of color. Number D is an attractive shade of red with white lettering, and Number C is a distinctive shade of copper rust which emphasizes the black and buff lettering and designs. The red, white and blue coloring of Number B makes the book attractive and appropriate for a citizenship text, but the blue coloring and green lettering of Number E fails to produce an attractive text.

By comparing the paper in the four texts, the writer found that the paper in textbook Number E is pure white; the paper in Number E is nearly pure white; and the paper in Numbers D and C are two shades of creamy white. The paper in Number C is a lighter shade than that in Number D; however the paper in each of the four texts is satisfactory. The paper in each book has a dull finish, a tough texture, and is sufficiently thick; however the paper in Numbers B and D is thicker than that of Numbers C and E; and the paper in Number D is the thickest of all.

Each of the texts rank high in legibility, length of line or margins, size of type, leading, and interlinear spacing. Number D is more legible, but the length of
lines is practically the same in each text. Numbers D and E rank higher than Numbers B and C in size of type; but the interlinear spacing appears to be the same in the four texts except in certain supplementary materials. With reference to the mechanical features of the four texts, Number D excels in a small degree. Numbers B and C rank slightly below Number D; and Number E stands fourth in comparison.

The Authors of the Texts

It appears that, in judging a textbook in the past, considerable emphasis has been placed upon the author of the text; but during more recent years facts have been presented to show that one is not certain of the author's identity regardless of the fact that an author's name appears in the text. These two points of view were revealed in the evaluation of author criteria. The author's score ranged from 10 to 250 points, but the final average of group averages was 113 points which is about 11.3 per cent of the whole.

In the comparison of the authors, the writer ranked the author of Number B as first for the following reasons: The author has been writing texts in community civics or in citizenship for at least sixteen years and probably for a much longer period. Also, he is the author or several
other textbooks in the social science field. He is a school man in a large city and doubtlessly has been a teacher of government. Textbooks, Numbers D and E, have been ranked equally, but below Number B. Each have two authors who hold similar positions. The authors of Number D are the dean of a college of education of a mid-western university and a supervisor of social science in the Detroit public schools. The authors of Number E are the head of the department of social science, Barringer High School, Newark, New Jersey, and the supervisor of high school instruction and head of the department of social studies of Girard College in Philadelphia.

Judging from the author's position, Number C was written by an author who is experienced in social studies. He is the head of the department of social science in the University of Chicago High School. The writer who made the comparison of these texts ranked the author of this text about ten per cent lower than the authors of Numbers D and E because one of the authors of Number D and Number E is the head of a department of social science in a college and, therefore, these texts might be expected to contain come material or an approach which is not found in a text which was written by one author only. According to the author of Number C, his text is a product of the classroom.
The Comparison of the Texts from the Standpoint of the Publisher, Recency of Publication and Cost to Students

Each of the four publishers enjoys the reputation of strength and reliability and, therefore, the texts are considered as equal in this respect. The textbooks are also nearly equal in regard to the recency of publication. Number B was copyrighted for the fourth time in 1937; Number E was copyrighted for the third time in 1936; Number C was copyrighted in 1935; and Number D was published and reprinted five times between March, 1935 and December, 1936.

The cost of these texts was compared by using the method described in Interpreting the Score of the Cost Item, which is found in Chapter III, Part II. This comparison was made upon the basis of the amount that each book should cost rather than upon the publisher's price of the text. This comparison indicated that Numbers C, D, and E are worth all that they cost; but that Number B, together with workbook, costs twenty-five per cent more than its actual value. By the same method of computing the cost item, however, the textbook itself, not including the workbook, is worth more than the publisher's price; but the workbook is worth only
A Comparison of the Content from the Standpoint of the Divisions of the Text

The Preface or Foreword

A comparison of prefaces or forewords in the four texts reveals that Number B and Number C contain forewords, but that Numbers D and E do not; however some of the same type of material which is contained in the forewords of Numbers B and C is also contained in the section "To the Teacher" in Number E. Also, in the section "To the Teacher" in Number D the author makes reference to the section as a preface. The forewords in Numbers B and C explain the major parts of the texts. In Numbers D and E similar, and more extensive remarks, are made in "To the Teacher".

The Table of Content

Each of the four texts contained a table of content, but the table of content in Number B is, by far, the most nearly complete. This table of content is divided into three parts, thirty chapters, and three hundred and forty-eight paragraphs besides Appendix A, B, C, and the
index. The paragraphs are numbered in the table of content to correspond to the numbers in the body of the book. These paragraphs are numbered successively from the first chapter to the last.

The table of content in Number C ranks second in this comparison. It contains four parts, twenty-three chapters, eighty-seven subheads, Appendix A and B, and the index. In number C the paragraphs of each chapter are numbered separately, but in Number B the paragraph numbers begin with the first of the text and extend through an unbroken sequency throughout the book.

The table of content in Numbers D and E are of about equal value. Both are less detailed than those found in Numbers B and C, but the table of content in Number D is slightly more detailed than that found in Number E. The table of content in Number D has five units (parts), thirty-three chapters, and Part I and II in the appendix. Neither the paragraphs nor its good index is listed in its table of content. The table of content in Number E lists seven units (parts), twenty-eight chapters, and an appendix; but it does not include paragraphs or its index.

The Author's Page to the Teachers

Textbook Number C does not have a page to teachers
except in so far as anyone may read the foreword which is of a more general nature than one might expect to be written for teachers who use the text. Number D has a page "To the Teacher" which is mentioned as a preface; and it is more of a preface than a teacher's page; however Number D devotes thirteen pages to "The Teaching of Civics" in Part I of the appendix, which is evidently written for the teacher. Number E has a page for the teacher also, and Number B contains four pages of "Suggestions to Teachers and Pupils". These suggestions appear to be more for the teacher than for the students, but they are practical.

The Author's Page to the Student

Texts, Numbers C and E, do not contain a page to the student; Number B has included four pages of "Suggestions to Teachers and Pupils"; and Number D has an excellent page addressed "To the Pupil", which draws the student's attention in a striking way to the necessity of his becoming interested in, and learning about, citizenship.

Sufficient Amount and Scope of Subject-Matter

One can hardly judge the amount and scope of subject-matter by the number of parts, units, chapters, or paragraphs entirely; but one can judge more of its
amount and scope by reference to pages and paragraphs than to parts, units, or chapters. Also, one can judge the amount and scope of subject-matter better by reference to chapters than to units or parts.

Number B contains 709 pages, plus 39 pages in the appendix and index, 348 paragraphs, sub-topics and other material, 30 chapters, and three major parts. The content is developed in considerable detail, and the text is the largest of the four compared. The 39 pages in the appendix and index include: (1) the federal constitution, (2) common customs of parliamentary procedure, (3) suggestions to teachers and pupils, and (4) 11 pages in the index.

Number C contains 601 pages, plus 34 pages in the appendix and index, 463 paragraphs, 23 chapters, and four major parts. The 34 pages in the appendix and index included: (1) the federal constitution, (2) tabular facts relative to the United States, and (3) over 12 pages in the index.

Number D contains 559 pages, plus 58 pages in the appendix and index, numerous problems, 470 paragraphs, 33 chapters, and five major units or parts; however the paragraphs are not developed to the extend that they are developed in Number B. In Number D thirteen pages are devoted to "The Teaching of Civics". Its appendix
includes the Declaration of Independence and the federal constitution with slight explanation of each clause. The index in Number D contains 17 pages.

Textbook, Number E, contains 552 pages, plus 23 pages in the appendix and index, 284 paragraphs and numerous sub-paragraphs, 29 chapters, and seven major units. The appendix contains the federal constitution, and the index consists of nine pages. The paragraphs in Number E, like the paragraphs in Number B, are developed in more detail than those in Numbers C and D. Each chapter in Number E also contains "Chapter Messages" at the beginning of each chapter. These messages are concise statements of the important points in each chapter.

Although Number E does not contain as many paragraphs as either of the other three texts, its paragraphs are developed in considerable detail.

Illustrations in the Texts

Number B ranks higher than the other texts with reference to the list of illustrations and to the revelancy, number and effectiveness of the illustrations contained in the texts. Number B contains a list of 375 illustrations; Number C contains a list of 220, but neither Number D nor Number E contain such a list. Number D provides about 110 illustrations, including
seven which are very small, and Number E contains about 213 illustrations and numerous "stick men" which may be considered as illustrations also. The illustrations in each text are revelent to the subject-matter, but those in Number B are the most effective and distinct. The illustrations in Number C rank second in effectiveness as well as in number, and those in Number E seem the least effective of all.

Charts, Graphs, Maps, Diagrams, and Tables

A comparison of the four texts, with reference to the revelancy, number and effectiveness of charts, graphs, maps, diagrams and tables, reveals the following information: Number D ranks first in these respects; Number B, second; Number C, third; and Number E, fourth. A survey of Number D shows about 31 charts, 7 maps, 4 graphs, and 6 tables, all of which are reasonably effective and are revelent. Number B contains about 8 charts, 4 maps, 3 graphs, and 7 tables. The charts, maps, graphs, and tables in Number B are not so effective as its illustrations. Number C contains about 9 charts, 4 graphs, and one table; but as a whole these are not so effective as those found in Number B and D. Number E contains about 10 charts, 4 diagrams, one graph, and one table. The diagrams are considerably more effective than
most of its charts; however some of its charts are good. Numbers C, D, and E show charts relative to the plans of city government, and Numbers B and D show the division of sections of land. As a whole the texts have better illustrations than charts, maps, diagrams, and tables. They have better charts than diagrams; and, in some instances, their maps are used as charts.

Summaries of the Texts

Number B has a splendid short, concise summary written in outline form in heavy black print at the close of each chapter. Number C contains short written (not outlined) summaries which are neither so concise nor so complete as those found in Number B. Number E has an occasional summary which is called a "review", and Number D does not provide a summary at all.

References and Bibliographies

Number C provided a "Class Library" which contains thirteen references, such as Heroes of Progress, Careers of Dangers and Darings, American Message, In Our Times, Uncle Sam's Modern Miracles, Readings in Community Life, Compton's Pictured Encyclopedia, The World Book Encyclopedia et cetera. Also, Number C provides 213 references in "class libraries" and 253 references for
"Home Readings" at the close of the chapters. The references in Number D refer largely to whole books rather than to chapters or pages.

Number B has 533 references, but most of its references refer to definite chapters or pages rather than to books as a whole. Also, the references in Number B refer to more texts in government than do the references in Number C. Number E provides three classes of references. It contains 242 "Readings for Recreation", 253 references for a "Working Bibliography", and 298 references "For the Teacher". The references in Number E refer to whole books rather than to chapters or pages.

Number D provides the least number of references of either of the four texts. It contains about 57 references for outside reading. Nearly all of these references are taken from about ten books; however Number D contains many problems which require considerable research outside of the ordinary reference field. As a whole, a larger percent of references in Number B refers to texts in government than do the references provided in the other texts; however the references in Numbers B, C, and E are more than sufficient.

Workbooks and Achievement Tests

Number B is the only one of these four texts which
provides a workbook. The workbook is based upon the text and is quite complete. It contains a few hundred short answer test questions; and the publishers provide a teacher's manual which contains, among other material, the answers to the questions in the workbook.

Suggestions to the Class

Each of the four texts contains many suggestions. Number D features several good class problems in each chapter. The problems are located following the material with which they are related rather than at the close of chapters. Some of these problems deal with bulletin board material or poster-work; others are for committee work, but the most of the problems in Number D are for individual solution. There are few, if any, suggestions for writing citizenship news for school publications or for the dramatic production of playlets relative to some phase of government. Neither does this text provide suggestions for class excursions, as such.

Number B provides a list of suggestions at the close of each chapter. These are mentioned as "projects", but contain many items which are mentioned as "problems" in Number D. As a whole, Number B contains more suggestions than Number D, but the problem-idea is featured in Number D throughout the text. Number B contains suggestions for the
organization of a Citizenship Club to promote civic consciousness. It also contains projects for committee work and class excursions to places of civic interest. Moreover, Number B suggests things to do and asks many questions throughout the regular reading material of the text. Number B also suggests poster-work and cartooning. It makes a few suggestions for the dramatic production of playlets relative to some phases of government and adds a few suggestions relative to writing news which deals with citizenship.

Number C provides several "Things to Do" at the close of each chapter. These include problems and projects for committees and individuals. Also, they include suggestions for poster-work and exhibits, a small number of suggestions relative to excursions to places of civic interest, and the organization of a civics club; but no suggestions are made for news-writing or dramatic productions.

At the close of each chapter in textbook, Number E, the authors have listed a large number of projects including those classified as follows: "For Your Bulletin Board", case studies and "Written Work". This "Written Work" consists of writing articles, a play or a poem et cetera. The "Bulletin Board" refers to poster-work, clippings, pictures, project surveys, or
other material which may be appropriately placed on a bulletin board. Each of the texts are rich in suggestions for group and individual activity.

Questions for Thought and Discussion

Each of the four texts provides a number of questions or problems. Many of the questions in Number B appear at the beginning of the chapters, but many are scattered throughout the chapters at points following the material with which the questions are related. At the close of the chapters in Number B one finds lists of problems, projects, and readings. Number B has at least 187 questions at the beginning of chapters, about 1,100 throughout other parts of the chapters, and about 90 things to do, not counting the projects.

Number C contains about 450 questions and problems at the close of the sections within the chapters, and "Things to Do" and readings at the close of the chapters. Number D contains about 106 problems and 268 questions at the close of the chapters. These are designated by the expression, "Testing What You Have Studies". Number E provides about 159 questions within the chapters, 790 questions at the close of the chapters, and about 60 other things to do. Also, Number E shows case problems, which provoke thought and discussion, at the close of the chapters.
These suggestions for thought and discussion do not include suggestions, bulletin boards, or written work.

The Appendix, Glossary, Index, and Teacher's Manual

The appendix in Number B is divided into three divisions; namely, Appendix A, B, and C. Appendix A, in textbook Number B, contains the federal constitution; Appendix B explains some common customs in parliamentary procedure; and Appendix C consists of about four page of suggestions to the teacher and student.

Appendix A, in Number C, consists of the federal constitution also; and Appendix B, in Number C, consists of a two-page table which lists the states, the dates that they entered the union, the area, population, number of representatives in congress, the electoral vote, and the educational rank by Phillips of each state in 1920 and 1930.

The first part of the appendix in textbook Number D deals with the teaching of civics; the second part of the appendix contains the Declaration of Independence and the constitution. Textbook, Number E, does not have an appendix as such, but it contains the constitution of the United States.

Neither of these four texts contains a glossary. This inadequacy, and the fact that some of the heavy black print
in Number B is a bit too small, are the only inadequacies that the writer has found in Number B.

The index of each book is sufficient. Number D provides 17 pages in its index; Number C contains 13 pages; Number B provides 11 pages; and Number E contains 9 pages in its index. But regardless of the number of pages in the index of Number D and Number B, the index in Number B is probably as detailed and as complete as that of Number D. This is due to the fact that the print used in the index of Number B is much smaller than the print used in the index of Number D.

Number B is the only text considered in this group which has a workbook and teacher's manual. This is a good workbook. It contains questions and other material which are based upon the text; and the teacher's manual covers the workbook as well as the textbook.

The Organization and Presentation of Subject-Matter in Textbook, Number B

The organization of the subject matter of Number B, from the standpoint of the amount, location, scope, and sequence of parts, chapters, topics, questions for thought and discussion, and other materials, ranks first in this comparison; and when the materials of subject-matter are considered in this comparison, Number B stands
considerably above either of the other texts.

Number B is presented in three major parts. Parts I and II deal with the sociological and political sides of citizenship and may be used as one semester's work. Part III considers economic citizenship and contains nearly enough material for another semester's work. This text contains considerably more subject matter than either of the other three texts.

In Number B the author discusses the meaning of citizenship, communities and community spirit, the people who compose our communities, the good citizen in the home, making the community attractive, community health and recreation, educational facilities and organizations, and the community as a character builder. Also, the author considers the general structure of government, political parties and elections, the national government, state government, local government, world relations, and the rights and duties of citizens.

In Part III, under economic citizenship, the author deals with the use and conservation of natural resources, communication, transportation, business organization, commerce and trade, governmental aid and control of business, occupations in public and private service, obtaining employment, proper standards of living, and making the world a better place in which to live.
Each of the texts consider much of the same material, but they differ in approach and in the amount of material and explanation. Number B is superior in these respects.

The subject-matter of textbook Number B is flexible. It is organized so as to provide for class recitation, committee work, individual projects and questions. Also, the use of the workbook allows each student to advance at his own rate of speed. The material is presented by beginning with material with which the student is acquainted and progresses to material with which the student is less acquainted. It is related to everyday activities and it is written in language that is not more difficult than essential to the best development of the student. The subject-matter contains many appropriate definitions and is developed in considerable detail. This text should be ranked higher than either of the other three from the standpoint of the choice of words. The text is pleasant reading and enjoys frequent revisions.

The Organization and Presentation of Subject-Matter in Textbook, Number C

From the standpoint of the organization and presentation, Number C ranks third in this comparison. As in the case of Number B, this part of the comparison deals with the amount, location, scope and sequency of
the parts, chapters, topics, questions for thought and discussion and other materials. Numerous accounts which are presented in Number B, and some topics which are included in Numbers B and E, are omitted in Number C.

Number C is divided into four major parts, 23 chapters, 87 sections, and 463 paragraphs. The author discusses the life of a citizen in his relation to others in the home, in the school, in the community, and in the world. In Part II he considers government, its services, law making, the enforcement of law, financing the government and the selection of public officials. The text contains material relative to privileges and responsibilities of citizens, the work of the world, conservation of natural resources, transportation, communication, industrial relations, vocational opportunities, public and professional services, and managing one's job.

As a whole Number C is well organized and includes many topics. It discusses the service, qualifications, training, advantages and disadvantages of many kinds of work. It mentions a number of requirements for different occupations; but as a whole the text discusses each topic less in detail than either Numbers B, D or E. The author begins by presenting material with which the student is acquainted and leads to material with which the student
is less acquainted. The verbal illustrations are well chosen and in many respects are related to everyday activities. The language is clear, easily understood, and effective; but as a whole the text is more elementary than either of the other three texts. The author presents his accounts in less detail than do the authors of Numbers B, D or E, but in nearly as much detail as do the authors of Number D. The presentation in Number C is interesting, accurate and pleasant; but the text fails to contain as much material as Number B or E. The subject-matter of Number C is flexible so as to provide for class recitation, and for questions and problems; but it is not as flexible as the other three texts.

The Organization and Presentation of Subject-Matter in Textbook, Number D

In textbook Number D real problems and investigations are stressed; and the problems are placed at intervals, following the material with which the problems are related, rather than at the close of the chapters. This has a tendency to stimulate the student to self-activity and to guide him in the study of community problems and in civic and political situations. Some of the problems help the student to understand the relationship between government
and economics. They tend to develop his attitude toward an improved social order, and contribute toward character-building.

The authors of Number D emphasize cooperation. They discuss our dependence on others, citizenship in the school, in the United States as a whole, group living, law and its observance, the purpose and method of taxation, education in our democracy, recreation and play, public safety, public health, and social welfare. Also, they consider transportation, communication, public utilities and their services, methods of appraising one's community, representing government in the United States, political parties and elections, the constitution, international relations, state government, local government, the consumers economic problems, money and banking, industrial relations, conservation, insurance and earning a living. Number D is a good text; but some of these topics are discussed more appropriately and in greater detail in the other three texts although they are not mentioned as major topics.

The subject matter contained in Number D is organized to provide for class recitation, questions covering the chapters, some additional reading, and many problems and projects for individual or group solution. The material is presented by beginning with material with which the
student is acquainted and leads the student to material with which he is less acquainted. The subject-matter is related to everyday activities and is written in appropriate language; but it does not provide so many definitions or so much material as Number B. It is pleasant reading and is a worthwhile text. As a whole it should be ranked definitely below Number B and slightly below the other two texts from the standpoint of organization and presentation of subject-matter.

The Organization and Presentation of Subject-Matter in Textbook, Number E

The organization and presentation of subject-matter in Number E, from the standpoint of the amount, location, scope and sequence of units, topics, questions for thought and discussion, and other materials, ranks second in this comparison; however, in some respects it ranks below Number C and D. The text is presented in seven units as follows: Unit One, "Yourself and others"; Unit Two, "You View Civic Welfare"; Unit Three, "You Weigh Some Civic Responsibilities"; Unit Four, "You Study Some Problems of Civic Improvement"; Unit Five, "You Observe Industrial Activities"; Unit Six, "You Explore Important Facts About Government"; Unit Seven, "You Glimpse the Horizon of Internationalism". At the beginning of each
chapter the authors state the main points which they refer to as "bird's-eye messages". These main points are simple, direct statements which are listed numerically at the beginning of each chapter. This text is the only one of the ten texts considered which employs this simple effective method. It informs the student at the outset concerning the points that he is to find; and while some may feel that such a method is a bit too elementary, it is effective.

This text lays emphasis upon the individual citizen. It is an unusual approach, but it is particularly effective in driving home the concept of individual responsibility for citizenship. The text also features the use of the bulletin board more than either of the other three texts. Some of the chapters in Number E include summaries which are called "reviews", but many of the chapters do not. Some paragraphs are followed by problems, and numerous questions are found at the close of each chapter. According to the authors, the material at the close of each chapter is intended to take the place of a workbook. This material at the close of each chapter is divided into three groups as follows: (1) questions, (2) definitions of civic terms used in the chapter, and (3) suggested work to do which covers the points in the chapter. Some of the suggested work
consists of case problems, questions for discussion, questions for individual consideration and written work. Also, the use of the bulletin board is featured in the supplementary work at the close of each chapter. The reference material which is found at the close of each chapter is divided into three divisions: (1) readings for recreation, (2) readings for the student, and (3) readings for the teacher.

The subject matter in this text is presented with a positive social approach. It discusses the individual, groups of individuals, communities of individuals, health, safety, recreation, education, civic pride, the care of the handicapped, poverty, crime, the family, the city, and the farm. Also, the authors consider transportation, communication, citizenship, occupations, business, and world of workers, profits, wages and other income, and economic problems.

Number E does not provide as much information relative to government as either of the other three texts; however, it presents some material relative of local, state, and national government, financing the government, public opinion and party politics. In all discussions the text has a strong personal appeal and is very worthwhile.

The subject-matter presented in Number E is organized so as to provide material for class recitation, committee
work, projects, questions, and bulletin board work. In these respects Number E is a superior text. In regard to its flexibility, it is superior to either Number D or Number C and is practically equal to Number B. In fact, in some respects Number E is the most flexible of the four texts considered. The material is presented by beginning with that which the student is most thoroughly acquainted and it leads the student to other material with which he is not acquainted. Many of the verbal illustrations are related to everyday activities, and the language is clear, concise and effective. Nearly all of the words are easily understood, but there are others of sufficient difficulty to increase the student's vocabulary. As a whole the material in this text is presented in more detail than is the material in Number C or Number D. It is interesting, pleasant, stimulates learning and is accurate. It is written with a strong social slant which is admirable and effective.

In the comparison of these four texts, from the standpoint of organization and presentation, Number B ranks first and Number E is nearly equal. These two texts stand above either Number C or Number D, but each of the four texts is well-organized and presented.

Subject-Matter Material Contained in the Four Texts

The meaning of American citizenship, including duties
and responsibilities as well as privileges, is explained in each of these four texts. Number B is more definite; Number D and E stand high in this respect; and Number C is good. Also, community life, community spirit, and community organization are presented in each text. In this, as in many other instances, Number B is the most superior text. Number B includes the early stages of primitive life and explains community living in somewhat more detail. Our American heritage is mentioned indirectly or occasionally in each text, but our heritage is emphasized more in Number E.

Good citizenship in the home, in the school and in the community (including health, recreation, the wise use of leisure, and ethical character) are considered in an effective manner in each text. Also, the necessity, purpose, and development of government are shown to a greater or lesser degree in each of the citizenship textbooks.

The development of knowledge and culture, including discoveries and inventions, are also discussed in each textbook; but, as in many instances, Number B stand first in this respect, Number D is second, while Number E and Number C stand next in order in this phase of the comparison.

In regard to the presentation of material, which
reveals the community as a character-builder, Number E is superior to the other three texts. Number D stands second, and Number C and E are about equal. Number D contains subject-matter which tends to mold character; and the whole theme of Number E tends to point to social justice which may be rightfully considered as character-building. Number C does not discuss any topic in much detail as do the other texts, but is contains more topics than some of the others. Number E mentions the privileges and duties of aliens, but it does not mention our work as individuals in the process of Americanization as do Numbers B, C, and D. In this respect Number B is first and Number C and E rank about equally.

The purpose and organization of political parties are discussed in each text. Number B stands first; Numbers C and D are about equal, and Number E ranks fourth in this comparison.

Little is said in either text relative to the founding of our democracy. Number B and Number D seem to rank about equally, and Numbers C and E say very little upon the subject; however, Number E points out what a democracy is, the advantages of a democracy, the aims of a democracy, representative democracy, our experience with democracy, and the necessity for the individual
citizen to be aware of the fact that our democracy may need improvement.

Each text discusses the legislative, executive and judicial branches of government. As in many instances in this comparison, Number B considers these in more detail than do the other texts. Numbers D and E devote about the same amount of attention to the subject, and Number C stands fourth in this report.

No one of the four texts devotes as much space to the history and meaning of the federal constitution in the supplementary material in the back of the book. Number B gives more attention to it throughout the material of the text, and Number D makes slight reference to its meaning in the subheads which are placed before the articles and amendments. In this respect Number B is the most superior; Number D stands second and, when considering all factors, Numbers C and E rank about equally.

Each of the texts consider the state constitutions to a greater or lesser degree; but little, if any, is said relative to the comparison of the state and federal constitutions. Numbers B, D, and E rank about equally; but, in this respect, Number C stands considerably below the other three texts.
Each of the texts discuss the organization of the town, township, city and country; but neither of the texts provides a separate unit, chapter, or supplement relative to the particular state government in which the text is used. Thus far the only text which has come to the writer's attention and provides for such supplementary material for use in the particular state in which the text is used is Magruder's American Government which is for a course in Constitution or American Government rather than for a course in Citizenship. It is offered in the eleventh or twelfth grades.

Number B is the only one of these four texts which provides a separate chapter for the study of United States territories and possessions; but Number B does not give the circumstances to explain why or how the territories or possessions were acquired. The other three texts mention the territories and insular possessions more casually.

Each of these texts mention national, state, and local taxation. They show the expenditures of government and the necessity for taxation. They also show the services of government and tend to interest the student in the study of the tax problem. Numbers B and D provide about the same amount of material relative to taxation and
Number C and E are approximately equal in this respect.

This comparison further reveals a definite step forward in the teaching of citizenship by the introduction of international relations and world-mindedness in the Citizenship course. Each of the four texts presents a chapter relative to international relations. Numbers B, C, and E are practically equal in this phase of the comparison, and Number D presents somewhat less material concerning internationalism. Each of the four tests are valuable for the development of world-mindedness.

Each text considers the satisfaction of human wants in more or less detail, and Number C devotes a chapter to the discussion. Numbers B and E name the factors in production, and Number C mentions them incidentally, but not by name. Number B discusses the stages of human progress; Number E devotes a short paragraph to the primitive family; Number D refers to early group living without mentioning the stages of progress, and Number C fails to mention the stages of development at all. Numbers B, D, C, and E refer to invention and to the use of machines but, in this respect, Number B ranks much higher than do the other texts. Also, each text discusses unemployment and the reasons for unemployment; but neither of the texts classify the unemployed as (1) the voluntary idle, (2) the unemployed, (3) the harmful employed, and
(4) the ineffectively employed as is suggested in the detailed check-list of criteria. Each text suggests such qualities as knowledge, reasonableness, thrift, obedience to law, honesty, and other worthy characteristics; but neither of the four texts approach the problem of right living by classifying the methods of struggling for existence as destructive, deceptive, persuasive, and productive methods; however, several qualities of character are mentioned or discussed incidentally in the four texts.

Each of these texts considers poverty, its alleviation and relief. Number E contains a chapter on poverty; Number B contains a few pages relative to poverty, its causes and relief; and Number D provides a short chapter relative to "Social Welfare" which includes a consideration of poverty.

The authors of each of the texts consider transportation, communication, trade, and commerce. In Number B one finds a chapter consisting of forty pages which is written to show "How Man Has Conquered Time and Space". Number C provides thirty-seven pages of material relative to transportation and communication; Number D devotes two chapters, containing thirty-four pages, to transportation and communication; and Number E contains a twenty-four page chapter which is devoted to this study.
Also, the authors of these texts discuss our natural resources and conservation. Number B discusses the extractive, genetic, and manufacturing industries, but it does not classify them, as such. In regard to the genetic industries, Number B mentions the kinds of farming as well as other material pertaining to agriculture. A chapter in Number C is devoted to the conservation of human and physical resources. The consideration of the human element in this way is a unique sociological approach to show that the nation benefits when individual welfare is taken into consideration. Number E does not contain material relative to natural resources, as such, and the text contains much less material relative to our physical resources than does Number B. Number D contains an effective chapter consisting of fourteen pages which deals with natural resources and conservation. In regard to providing material concerning our natural resources and conservation, Number B is the most superior text; Number C ranks second; Number D, third; and reference is made to such material in Number E.

In comparing the four texts in regard to their consideration of occupations, professional services, vocational guidance, preparation and qualification of workers, advantages and disadvantages of occupations,
the dignity of labor and service, finding one's job et cetera, Number C is the most desirable text; but Number B contains much worthwhile material along this line.

There are 149 pages in Number C relative to this phase of citizenship, not including "Managing One's Income". Number D also contains material devoted to the study of occupations; Number E contains six chapters relative to industrial activities, including four chapters concerning "Choosing An Occupation", "Our Business World", "The World of Workers", "Profits, Wages, and Other Income". Besides the chapter in Number E relative to "Choosing an Occupation", Number E also contains similar material interwoven with other materials found elsewhere in the text.

Numbers B and C discuss saving, home ownership and investments; Number D considers saving and home ownership; Number E considers saving, wise spending, the modern home, the modern farm et cetera; but it appears that the authors of Number E have omitted a discussion of home ownership and private investment. In this connection, Number B and C are practically equal, and Number D ranks third.

In comparing the four texts, from the standpoint of their study of economic conditions and movements of the past together with their failure and successes, neither
of these texts offer enough material to merit special consideration. Considerable material is presented relative to present conditions, especially in the field of labor, wages, and relief. Number B includes some material pertaining to government ownership, communism, and socialism; Number C devotes a paragraph to socialism, but neither of the texts are radical.

In comparing the texts, from the standpoint of showing qualities of good American citizenship (including health, tolerance, sympathy, justice, responsibility, culture, the use of leisure, large-group consciousness, moral behavior and fellowship, social, economic, religious, industrial and political ideals, and respect for the rights and opinions of others), neither of the four texts mention all of these qualities; however the author of authors of each text mention several of the qualities of good citizenship under material designated as the "Meaning of Citizenship", the "Value of Ideals" or elsewhere throughout the text; and each textbook tends to develop good citizenship.

With reference to the comparison of subject-matter material contained in the four texts, Number B ranks first; Number C, second; and Numbers D and E are approximately equal in this respect.
The investigation shows that:

(1) Some city schools and state departments of education are making comparative studies of textbooks before the adoption of a text.

(2) Replies received concerning the writer's check-list indicate that such a check-list is worthy of consideration. These facts are shown in the Resume Concerning Replies Received Relative to the Check-List of Criteria in Appendix B.

(3) The comparison of the texts with each other, as shown in Chapter V, reveals that, in some instances, the authors of the texts did not devote separate chapters or paragraphs to certain topics, but wove the most important elements of those topics into other subject-matter in the texts.

(4) From a careful analysis of Table III, in Appendix A, and Chapter V one may reasonably conclude that the relative standing of the four texts found by the use of the detailed check-list approximates the relative standing of the texts found by comparing the texts with each other.

(5) On the scale of one thousand points, the five
major divisions of criteria for the selection of a citizenship textbook, together with the final score as determined by the evaluators of the writer's check-list, are as follows: (1) Mechanical features, 131 points, (2) Author, 113 points, (3) Publisher, recency of publication and cost to students, 110 points, (4) Content, from the standpoint of preface or foreword, table of content, author's page to the teacher, author's page to the students, illustrations, suggestions to the class, workbook, appendix, glossary, index, et cetera, 308 points, (5) Subject-Matter, including the organization and presentation of subject-matter, 338 points. This shows that the content and subject-matter comprise about two-thirds of the criteria for comparing citizenship textbooks and that mechanical features, author, publisher, recency of publication and cost to students comprise about one-third of the criteria. In this connection, each of the following make up about one-ninth of the criteria: (1) Mechanical features, (2) Author, (2) Publisher, recency of publication and cost to students. (For further details see The Evaluated Check-List and Table I in Appendix A, pages 66-78 and especially the final scores in column 8, pages 69, 70, 74, 76, and 77.)
The comparison of the many phases of these four texts with each other shows that Number B (Building Citizenship by R. O. Hughes) is the best of the four texts. Number D (Civics Through Problems by James B. Edmonson and Arthur Dondineau) ranks second; Number E (My Worth to the World by Louise I Capen and D. Montfort Melchior) stands third; and Number C (The Life and Work of the Citizen by Howard C. Hill) is fourth. In some respects, Number C is the most valuable text and, in other respects, Number E is the most valuable of the four. Number C is the most elementary of the four textbooks; but it touches many phases of citizenship in an interesting manner and, in several respects, is superior to Number E. Number E seems more personal and is written with a definite social slant. Number D does not deal with so many topics as does Numbers B and C. As a whole its topics are developed in more detail than the topics in Number C. It features the use of problems and, in this respect, Number D is the best textbook. Each of the four texts excels the others in some respect and, therefore, the writer would suggest that Number B should be used as the main text and that Number C, D, and E be used for supplementary reference.
APPENDIX A

Letter of Explanation and Author's Check-List

The following letter of explanation was sent with the check-list of criteria to those who were asked to evaluate it; and the check-list is shown on the following page:

Huron, Kansas,
March 1, 1938.

______.
______.
______.

Being a teacher of Social Science, I am making A Comparative Study of Textbooks in Citizenship for High Schools and would like your cooperation in my study of this problem. I wish to set up a check-list of criteria 1,000 points. The criteria are divided into five major divisions which are subdivided into several more. Please place the number of points that you think each item merits in the space provided at the right of each item and accept my thanks.

If you think of other criteria and will include these or a check-list of your own, I shall appreciate your thoughtfulness.

Very respectfully yours,

T. A. James.
Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks
(Score on the basis of 1,000 points)

I. Mechanical features:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Score of Individual Items</th>
<th>Total Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Convenient size--i.e. neither too bulky, nor too small.</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Durability, including resistance to soiling.</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Attractiveness - i.e. artistic design, including</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a</td>
<td>Decoration and lettering.</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>Color, determined by four qualities below:</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1) Green for kindness to the eyes.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(2) Blue because of student preference.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(3) Red because of student preference.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(4) Other colors.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pure white.</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Dull finish.</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Tough texture.</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score of individual items</td>
<td>Total score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Thickness of paper. Score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

D Print:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Legibility. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Conformity to standards:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a Length of line or margins.</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b Size of type and leading.</td>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c Interlinear spacing. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL SCORE FOR ALL MECHANICAL FEATURES
(Total under 1)

11 Author of citizenship textbook:
A Authoritativeness of the author, judged by the author's experience in the field as a teacher, author, or as a leader in civic life. Score

TOTAL SCORE OF AUTHOR CRITERIA (Total under 11)

111 Publisher, recency of publication, and cost to students:
A Reliability of publisher. Score
B Recency of publication. Score

(Citizenship texts need yearly revision)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Score of individual items</th>
<th>Total Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C Cost of texts to students.</td>
<td>Score_</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL SCORE FOR PUBLISHER CRITERIA, RECENCY OF PUBLICATION, AND COST TO STUDENTS.**

**IV Content from standpoint of divisions of textbook as follows:**

1. Preface or foreword. Score_

2. Table of content. Score_

3. Author's page to teacher. Score_

4. Author's page to student. Score_

5. Sufficient amount and scope of subject-matter. Score_

6. Illustrations:
   a List of illustrations. Score_
   b Revelancy, number, and effectiveness of illustrations. Score_

7. Charts. Score_

8. Maps. Score_

9. Diagrams. Score_

10. Tables. Score_

11. Summary at the close of each unit or chapter. Score_

12. References and bibliographies. Score_
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Score of individual items</th>
<th>Total score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Workbook, based upon and supplementary to the particular textbook considered. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Achievement tests with keys which are based upon the textbook or upon the workbook compiled for use with the particular textbook considered. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Suggestions to the class for writing news which deals with citizenship for school publications. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Suggestions to the class for the dramatic production playlots relative to some phase of government. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Suggestions to the class for citizenship postor-exhibits. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Suggestions to the class for excursions to places of civic interest. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Suggestions to the class for committee work and projects. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Suggestions for the organization of a citizenship club or society for the promotion of civic consciousness and for parliamentary procedure. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Score of individual items</td>
<td>Total score</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Questions for thought and discussion, placed as necessary throughout the subject-matter, or listed at the close of the unit or chapter. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Appendix. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Glossary. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Index. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Teacher's manual for textbook, including teacher's manual for workbook. Score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL SCORE FOR CONTENT FROM THE STANDPOINT OF DIVISIONS OF THE TEXT (Total under IV)

V Subject-matter:

A Organization and presentation:

1 Organization and presentation of subject-matter, including the amount, location, scope and sequence of units, topics, questions for thought and discussion, and of other materials. Score

2 Flexibility of subject-matter. Score

3 Presentation of subject-matter according to the method of approach, verbal illustrations, clearness,
coniseness and effectiveness of language at the proper age-level. Score

4 Accuracy of subject-matter. Score

5 Interest and pleasantness of subject-matter. Score

TOTAL SCORE FOR CRITERIA OF ORGANIZATION AND PRESENTATION OF SUBJECT-MATTER (Total under VA)

B The materials of subject-matter contained in the citizenship textbook, such as articles dealing with local and state government, health and recreation, the use and conservation of natural resources, the home and the community life, etc., etc., etc., Score

TOTAL SCORE FOR THE MATERIALS OF SUBJECT-MATTER WHICH ARE NOT CONSIDERED UNDER NO. VA, ABOVE.

TOTAL SCORE FOR ALL CRITERIA FOR (1) MECHANICAL FEATURES, (2) AUTHOR, (3) PUBLISHER, RECENCY OR PUBLICATION AND COST, (4) CONTENT, (5.A) ORGANIZATION AND PRESENTATION OF SUBJECT-MATTER WHICH ARE CONTAINED IN THE CITIZENSHIP TEXTBOOK AS MENTIONED IN V.B., ABOVE  1,000
The Evaluated Check-List

The following symbols, together with their respective groups for which they stand, are used in Table I (see next page) to designate the average score that individuals of the various groups awarded to the items in the check-list; and Column 8 of Table I shows the final average of group averages:

1. The United States Office of Education and state departments of education.

2. The evaluator of the criteria for the board of education in the District of Columbia and city superintendents.

3. Kansas county superintendents of public instruction, including a former county superintendent and a member of the Kansas advisory committee on textbook adoptions.

4. Experienced college teachers.

5. Experienced high school teachers, including members of the Kansas advisory committee on textbook adoptions.

6. Publishers of textbooks on citizenship for high schools or of citizenship material.

7. Laymen.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I Mechanical features:</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Size of textbook:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Convenient size--</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.e. neither too</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>heavy, too bulky,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nor too small.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Binding:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Durability,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>including</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>resistance to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>soiling. Score</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Attractiveness--</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i.e. artistic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>design, including</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Decoration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and lettering.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final average of group averages.
Table I continued
Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks on the Bases of 1,000 Points

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final average of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>b. Color, determined by four listed below. Score</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1) Green for kindness to the eyes.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Blue because of student preference.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Red because of student preference.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Other colors.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C. Paper:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Pure white. Score</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Dull finish. Score</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Tough texture. Score</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Thickness of paper. Score</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table I continued

Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks on the Bases of 1,000 Points

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final average of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D. Print:</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Legibility. Score</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Conformity to standards:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Length of line or margins. Score</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Size of type and leading. Score</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Interlinear spacing. Score</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AVERAGED SCORE FOR ALL MECHANICAL FEATURES | 113 | 120 | 150 | 100 | 115 | 104 | 217 | 131 |

II. Author of textbook:

A. Authoritativeness of the author, judged by the author's experience in the field as a teacher, author, or as a leader in civic life. Score | 54 | 100 | 175 | 150 | 111 | 100 | 100 | 113 |
The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final average of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### AVERAGE SCORE OF AUTHOR CRITERIA

#### III. Publisher, recency of publication, and cost to students:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Reliability of publisher</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B. Recency of publication.</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| C. Cost of texts to students. Score | 39 | 20 | 35 | 33 | 44 | 27 | 37 | 34 |

### AVERAGE SCORE FOR PUBLISHER CRITERIA, RECENCY OF PUBLICATION AND COST TO STUDENTS.

| 127 | 100 | 100 | 91  | 129 | 90  | 133 | 110 |

### IV. Content from the standpoint of the divisions of the textbook as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Preface or foreword.</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table I continued

Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks
on the Bases of 1,000 Points

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final average of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluated Criteria</th>
<th>Score 1</th>
<th>Score 2</th>
<th>Score 3</th>
<th>Score 4</th>
<th>Score 5</th>
<th>Score 6</th>
<th>Score 7</th>
<th>Score 8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Table of content. Score</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Author's page to teachers.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Author's page to students.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Sufficient amount and scope of subject-matter. Score</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Illustrations:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. List of illustrations.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Revelancy, number, and effectiveness of the illustrations. Score</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Charts. Score</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Maps. Score</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Diagrams. Score</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Tables. Score</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Summary at the close of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table I continued

Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks on the Bases of 1,000 Points

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final averages of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12. References and bibliographies</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Workbook based upon, and supplementary to, the particular textbook considered. Score</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Achievement tests with keys which are based upon the text, or upon the workbook compiled for use with the particular textbook considered. Score</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Suggestions to the class for writing news relative to citizenship for school publications. Score</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Suggestions to the class for</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table I continued

Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks on the Bases of 1,000 Points

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final average of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

17. Suggestions to the class for citizenship poster exhibits. Score

18. Suggestions to the class for excursions to places of civic interest. Score

19. Suggestions to the class for committee work and projects. Score

20. Suggestions for the organization of a citizenship club or society for the promotion of civic consciousness and for parliamentary procedure. Score
Table I continued
Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks on the Bases of 1,000 Points

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final averages of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21. Questions for thought and discussion, placed as necessary throughout the subject-matter or listed at the close of such unit or chapter. Score</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Appendix. Score</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Glossary. Score</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Index. Score</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Teacher’s manual for textbook, including teacher’s manual for workbook. Score</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AVERAGE SCORE FOR CONTENT FROM THE STANDPOINT OF DIVISIONS OF THE TEXT

|   | 300 | 316 | 328 | 265 | 268 | 320 | 350 | 308 |

V. Subject-Matter:

A. Organization and
Table I continued

Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks on the Bases of 1,000 Points

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final averages of group averages.

presentation:

1. Organization and presentation of subject-matter, including the amount, location, scope and sequence of units, topics, questions for thought and discussion and of other materials.

Score

2. Flexibility of subject-matter.

Score

3. Presentation of the subject-matter according to the
Table I continued
Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks
on the Bases of 1,000 Points

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final average of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>approach, verbal illustrations, clearness, conciseness and effectiveness of language at the proper age-level. Score</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Accuracy of subject-matter. Score</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Interest and pleasantness of subject-matter. Score</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AVERAGE SCORE FOR CRITERIA OF ORGANIZATION AND PRESENTATION OF SUBJECT-MATTER (V. A.)

B. The materials of subject-matter contained in citizenship textbook, such as articles dealing with
Table I continued

Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks
on the Bases of 1,000 Points

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final averages of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVERAGE SCORE FOR THE MATERIALS OF SUBJECT-MATTER WHICH ARE NOT CONSIDERED UNDER V. A., ABOVE</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVERAGE SCORE FOR ALL CRITERIA FOR (1) MECHANICAL FEATURES, (2) AUTHOR, (3) PUBLISHER, RECENCY OF PUBLICATION</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

local and state government, health and recreation, the use and conservation of natural resources, home and community life etc. etc. etc.
Table I continued
Evaluated Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks on the Bases of 1,000 Points

The first seven of these arabic numerals are used as symbols to designate the above seven groups consulted. The numbers listed in the first seven columns are average scores for each group and No. 8 shows the final average of group averages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AND COST, (4) CONTENT, (5.A.) ORGANIZATION AND PRESENTATION OF SUBJECT-MATTER, AND (5.B.) MATERIALS OF SUBJECT-MATTER WHICH ARE CONTAINED IN THE CITIZENSHIP TEXTBOOK AS MENTIONED IN V. B. ABOVE

In terms of per cent, the findings in column 8 of Table I reveal the following per cent of the total score for each major division: (1) Mechanical features, 13.1%; (2) Author, 11.3%; (3) Publisher, recency of publication and cost to students, 11%; (4) Content, 30.8%; (5A) Organization and presentation of subject-matter, 27.4%; and (5B) Other materials of subject-matter, 6.4%.
Textbooks and Their Numerical Symbols

Considered in Table II


7. The Foundations of American Government, with workbook, by Herman A. Spindt and Frederick Lynne Ryan. Published by D. C. Heath and Company.


The following were not scored by the check-list of criteria, but are good for supplementary study in citizenship:

1. An Outline in Civics and a Workbook and Study Outline for Problems of American Democracy. These two are not textbooks; they consist of citizenship material by Raymond R. Ammarell, and are published by the McKinley Publishing Company, Philadelphia.

2. A History of Our Times, V. I and II. This is citizenship material rather than a textbook. The authors are Arthur Henry Meohlman and Harrison M. Sayre. It is published by the American Education Press, Columbus, Ohio.

3. Civics of Today, a Workbook. Also, a teacher's manual for the workbook and the New Deal, which is the National Program of the Roosevelt Administration. The author is Charles H. Seaver and the publisher is Benj. H. Sanborn and Company. The publishers mention that the workbook may be used as a combination of textbook and workbook in case reference texts are available.

The Selection of Four Citizenship Textbooks from Among Ten Textbooks Considered.

Table II includes the evaluated criteria for scoring
text books in citizenship, the score of the textbooks considered and the per cent of correlation of the total score of each textbook with the possible score. The arabic numerals: 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, and 10 are used as symbols to designate the ten textbooks considered.

Criteria for Textbook Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Mechanical features:</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Size of textbook:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Convenient size--i.e.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>neither too heavy, too bulky, nor too small.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Binding:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Durability, including resistance to soil ing. Score</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Attractiveness--i.e. artistic design, including a. Decoration and lettering. Score</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table II continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria for Textbook Selection</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Color, determined by the four listed below. Score</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Green for kindness to the eyes.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Blue because of student preference.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Red because of student preference.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Other colors.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C. Paper:

1. Pure white. Score 7 6 2 6 5 6 6 6 6 6
2. Dull finish. Score 7 9 9 7 9 7 9 9 9 9
3. Tough texture.
   Score 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9
4. Thickness of paper.
   Score 4 6 6 6 6 6 5 5 5 5

D. Print:

1. Legibility. Score 19 19 17 17 20 15 15 16 18 19
Table II continued

Criteria for Textbook Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Conformity to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>standards:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Length of line or</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>margins. Score</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Size of type and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>leading. Score</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Interlinear</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>spacing. Score</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORE FOR ALL</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MECHANICAL FEATURES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II. Author of textbook:

A. Authoritativeness of
the author as
judged by the
author's experience
in the field as a
teacher, author, or
as a leader in civic
life. Score        | 85 | 110| 90 | 85 | 100| 95 | 95 | 100| 90 | 100 |
| SCORE FOR AUTHOR    | 85 | 110| 90 | 85 | 100| 95 | 95 | 100| 90 | 100 |
| CRITERIA           |                      | |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |    |

III. Publisher, recency of
publication, and cost
Criteria for Textbook Selection to students:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Reliability of publisher. Score</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Recency of publication. Score</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Cost of texts to students. Score</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SCORE FOR PUBLISHER CRITERIA, REGENCY OF PUBLICATION, AND COST TO STUDENTS

|   | 99 | 101 | 88 | 107 | 108 | 95 | 94 | 101 | 105 | 107 |

IV. Content from the standpoint of the divisions of the textbook as follows:

1. Preface or foreword.

| Score | 4 | 5 | 6 | 4 | 0 | 5 | 6 | 5 | 5 | 0 |

2. Table of content.

| Score | 10 | 10 | 9 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 8 | 8 | 8 |

3. Author's page to teachers.

| Score | 0 | 5 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 6 |

4. Author's page to students.

<p>| Score | 0 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 0 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria for Textbook Selection</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. Sufficient amount and scope of subject-matter. Score</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Illustrations:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. List of illustrations.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Relevancy, number, and effectiveness of the list of illustrations. Score</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Charts. Score</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Maps. Score</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Diagrams. Score</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Tables. Score</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Summary at the close of each unit or chapter. Score</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. References and bibliographies. Score</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Workbook, based upon and supplementary to the particular textbook considered, Score</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table II continued

#### Criteria for Textbook Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14. Achievement tests with keys which are based upon the text, or upon the workbook compiled for use with the particular textbook considered. Score</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Suggestions to the class for writing news relative to citizenship for school publications. Score</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Suggestions to the class for dramatic productions of playlets relative to some phases of government. Score</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Suggestions to the class for citizenship poster exhibits. Score</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Suggestions to the class for excursions to places of civic interest. Score</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criteria for Textbook Selection</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Suggestions to the class for committee work and projects. Score</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Suggestions for the organization of a citizenship club or society for the promotion of civic consciousness and for parliamentary procedure. Score</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Questions for thought and discussion placed as necessary throughout the subject-matter or listed at the close of each unit or chapter. Score</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Appendix. Score</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Glossary. Score</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table II continued

Criteria for Textbook Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>24. Index. Score</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Teacher's manual for textbook, including teacher's manual for workbook. Score</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SCORE FOR CONTENT FROM THE STANDPOINT OF DIVISIONS OF THE TEXT.

|                               | 132 | 231 | 69 | 66 | 141 | 107 | 178 | 127 | 116 | 127 |

V. Subject-Matter:

A. Organization and presentation:

1. Organization and presentation of subject-matter, including the amount, location, scope and sequence or units, topics, questions for thought and discussion, and other materials.

<p>| Score | 45 | 58 | 18 | 35 | 50 | 50 | 40 | 52 | 50 | 55 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria for Textbook Selection</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Flexibility of subject-matter.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Presentation of the subject-matter according to the approach, verbal illustrations, clearness, conciseness, and effectiveness of language at the proper age-level.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Accuracy of subject-matter.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Interest and pleasantness of subject-matter.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORE FOR CRITERIA OF ORGANIZATION AND PRESENTATION OF SUBJECT-MATTER (V.A.)</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Criteria for Textbook Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. The materials of subject-matter contained in the citizenship textbook, such as articles dealing with local and state government, health and recreation, the use and conservation of natural resources, home and community life etc. etc. etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SCORE FOR THE MATERIALS OF SUBJECT-MATTER WHICH ARE NOT CONSIDERED UNDER V.A. ABOVE, SCORE | 50 | 60 | 30 | 30 | 45 | 55 | 40 | 55 | 55 | 50 |

SCORE FOR ALL CRITERIA FOR (1) MECHANICAL FEATURES, (2) AUTHOR, (3) PUBLISHER, REGENCY OF PUBLICATION AND
Criteria for Textbook Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COST, (4) CONTENT, (5.A.) ORGANIZATION AND PRESENTATION OF SUBJECT-MATTER, AND (5.B) MATERIALS OF SUBJECT-MATTER WHICH ARE CONTAINED IN THE CITIZENSHIP TEXTBOOK AS MENTIONED IN V.B., ABOVE</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CORRELATION OF SCORE WITH POSSIBLE SCORE</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>89.2%</td>
<td>56.9%</td>
<td>64.1%</td>
<td>76.5%</td>
<td>71.5%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>62.5%</td>
<td>73.9%</td>
<td>76.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>700</td>
<td>892</td>
<td>569</td>
<td>641</td>
<td>765</td>
<td>715</td>
<td>710</td>
<td>625</td>
<td>739</td>
<td>761</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks,
Together with the Per cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score, and the Score of the
Four Textbooks Compared

The comparison of the four textbooks consisted of
two parts: first, a comparison by the use of a more
detailed check-list than the one used in the selection
of the four texts from among ten citizenship textbooks
(see Table I) and, second, the comparison of the four
texts with each other.

The detailed check-list which was used for scoring
the four textbooks, together with the per cent of
correlation with the possible score, and the score of
the four textbooks compared, is presented on the
following page in Table III. In this table the letter,
A, represents the evaluated score by which the four
texts were compared, and the letters B, C, D and F are
used as symbols to represent the four textbooks
considered.
These symbols, together with the textbooks which they represent, are as follows:

B---Building Citizenship by R. O. Hughes; published by Allyn and Bacon.

C---The Life and Work of the Citizen by Howard C. Hill; published by Ginn and Company.


E---My Worth to the World by Louise I. Capen and D. Montfort Melchior; published by the American Book Company.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table III</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>I. Mechanical features:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>A. Size of citizenship textbook:</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Convenient size---i.e. neither too heavy, too bulky, nor too small.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>B. Bindings:</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Durability, including resistance to soiling.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>2. Attractiveness---i.e. artistic design, including</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>SYMBOLS</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the per cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a. Decoration and lettering</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>b. Color: Score</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(1) Green for kindness to the eyes.
(2) Blue because of student preference.
(3) Red because of student preference.
(4) Other colors.

C. Paper:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Pure white</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. Dull finish</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3. Tough texture</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4. Thickness of paper</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score and the Score
of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D. Print:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Legibility. Score</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Conformity to standards:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Length of line or margins. Score</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Size of type and leading. Score</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Interlinear spacing. Score</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL SCORE FOR ALL MECHANICAL FEATURES</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II. Author of citizenship textbook:
A. Authoritativeness of the author, judged by the author's experience in the field as a teacher, author or leader in civic life. Score | 113 | 110 | 90 | 100 | 100 |
| TOTAL SCORE FOR AUTHOR CRITERIA | 113 | 110 | 90 | 100 | 100 |
### Table III continued

#### Detailed Criteria for Scoring

Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per cent of Correlation with the possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### III. Publisher, recency of publication and cost:

A. Reliability of publisher.

Score: 36 36 36 36 36

B. Recency of publication

(Citizenship textbooks need yearly revision)

Score: 40 39 35 38 37

C. Cost of textbook to students. Score: 34 26 34 34 34

**TOTAL SCORE FOR PUBLISHER, RECENCY OF PUBLICATION AND COST**

110 101 105 108 107

#### IV. Content from the standpoint of the divisions of the textbook:

A. Completeness of citizenship textbook:

1. Preface or foreword.

Score: 6 5 5 0 0
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per cent of Correlation with the
Possible Score and the Score of
the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Table of Contents.

Score

3. Author's page to the
teacher relative to
the teaching of
citizenship and to the
use of the text. Score

4. Author's page to the
student relative to
the subject of
citizenship and the
use of the text. Score

5. Sufficient amount and
scope of subject-matter.

Score

6. Illustrations:

   a. List of
      illustrations
      contained in the
textbook. Score
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

| b. Revelancy, number and effectiveness of illustrations for the explanation of subject-matter. Score | SYMBOLS | 16 | 15 | 14 | 15 | 15 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|

7. Charts:

| a. Revelancy, number and effectiveness of charts. Score | 10 | 9 | 5 | 8 | 2 |

8. Maps:

| a. Revelancy, number and effectiveness of maps. Score | 11 | 7 | 1 | 6 | 0 |

9. Diagrams:

| a. Revelancy, number, and effectiveness of diagrams. Score | 11 | 10 | 2 | 9 | 0 |

10. Tables:

| a. Revelancy, number |   |   |   |   |   |
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per Cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score and the Score
of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>and effectiveness</th>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>of tables. Score</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Summary at the</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>close of each unit</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>or chapter. Score</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. References and</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bibliography of</td>
<td>books and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>concerning the</td>
<td>subject at the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>or chapter. Score</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Work-book based upon,</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and supplementary</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to the particular</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>textbook</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>considered. Score</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14. Achievement tests with scoring keys which are based upon the textbook or upon the workbook compiled for use with the particular textbook considered. Score</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Suggestions to the class for writing citizenship news for school publications. Score</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Suggestions to the class for the dramatic production of playlets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared relative to some phases of government or citizenship. Score

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17. Suggestions to the class for citizenship-poster exhibit. Score</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Suggestions to the class for excursions to places of civic interest. Score</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Suggestions to class for committee work and projects. Score</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Suggestions for the organization of citizenship club</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

21. Questions for thought and discussion placed as necessary throughout the subject-matter or listed at the close of the unit or chapter. Score

| Score    | 17| 16| 14| 17| 16 |

22. Appendix. Score

| Score    | 10| 10| 8 | 9 | 8 |

23. Glossary:

a. List of the
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per Cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score and the Score
of the Four Textbooks Compared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

24. Index:

a. A relatively complete index which lists the location of the important topics,
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks compared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

25. Teacher's manual for the textbook, including teacher's manual for the workbook which has been prepared for use with the textbook.

Score 16 16 0 0 0

TOTAL SCORE FOR CONTENT FROM THE STANDPOINT OF THE DIVISIONS OF THE TEXT 308 231 116 141 127

V. Subject-matter:

A. Organization and presentation of subject-matter:
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per Cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score and the Score
of the Four Textbooks Compared

| 1. Organization of subject-matter as to the amount, location, scope, and sequence of units, topics, questions for thought and discussion, and other materials. Score | SYMBOLS |  |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| A | B | C | D | E |
| 60 | 58 | 50 | 50 | 55 |

2. Flexibility:
(a) The organization of subject-matter so as to provide for class recitations, committee work, projects, reports or other methods which allow for the advancement of each student
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Presentation of subject-matter:
   a. Beginning with materials with which the student is acquainted.
      progressing to materials with which the student is less acquainted, and progressing further to materials
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b. The presentation of subject-matter by verbal illustrations in order to relate the subject-matter to everyday activities.

c. Presentation of subject-matter according to language:
Table III continued

Detailed criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Style of language construction:</th>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Clearness. Score</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Conciseness. Score</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Effectiveness. Score</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) Choice of words:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Words of sufficient difficulty to increase vocabulary in the subject-matter and to convey meaning, but not of such difficulty as to obstruct understanding. Score</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

d. Presentation and development of accounts in considerable
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per Cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score and the Score
of the Four Textbooks Compared

detail (Preferred by
students according to Kyte).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

e. Presentation of subject-matter in interesting
methods to promote
pleasantness and stimulate
learning. Score

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

f. Accuracy of facts presented.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL SCORE FOR ORGANIZATION AND
PRESENTATION OF SUBJECT-MATTER

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>274</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>256</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

V.B. Subject-matter Material

Contained in the Citizenship
Textbook, such as the
following:

1. The meaning of American
citizenship, including
duties and responsibilities
as well as privileges and
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per Cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score and the Score
of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Immunities. Score

2. Community life,
   community spirit and
   community organization,
   including community
development and stages
   of early community
   life. Score

3. Our American heritage:
race, national,
political, social, and
economic. Score

4. Good citizenship in
   the home, the school,
   and the community,
   including the promotion
   of health, recreation,
   the wise use of
   leisure and ethical
   character. Score

Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per Cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score and the Score
of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. The necessity, purpose, and development of government. Score</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The development of knowledge and culture, including discoveries and inventions which have aided learning as well institutions of learning. Score</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1/2</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The community as a character builder, including the value of high ideals, the work of the churches (not denominationalism) and moral obligations. Score</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The purpose and importance of government in a democracy, including</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9. The work and organization of political parties, including the election of officials. Score</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. The founding of our democracy. Score</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. The organization of our federal government into (a) legislative, (b) executive, and (c) judicial branches. Score</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. The federal constitution; its history and meaning. This must be explained in language that students may understand. Score</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1/2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13. State constitutions in general and the comparison of state constitutions with the federal constitution.
Score

|         | 2 | 2 | 1 1/2 | 11/2 | 11/2 |

14. Local governments and their organization, including the town, township, city, and county. Score

15. Concise unit explaining the state, county, township, city, and town governments of the state in which the text is used unless the citizenship text provides a supplement relative to
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Territories and insular possessions of the United States outlining concisely the circumstances of acquisition and the organization and plan of their government. Score</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Qualities and benefits of our government—life, liberty etc. Score</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Financing national, local and state government, including the necessity of taxation and methods of taxation employed and suggested by others. Score</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1½</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1½</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

19. Our international relations with world-minded approach, including the world-community concept, rights and duties of nations, methods of settling disputes, and the promotion of peace.

20. Satisfaction of human wants, factors of production, economic progress of the race, including stages of progress, invention and use of machines, the voluntarily idle, the unemployed, the harmfully employed, the
Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1 1/2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1/2</td>
<td>1/2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ineffectively employed and the basic reasons therefor. Also, the Characteristics of a capable race which are (a) knowledge, (b) forethought, (c) dependability, and (d) reasonableness all of which are shown by knowledge of physical and social environment, and by industry, thrift, honesty, sobriety, courage, judgment, fidelity, eagerness to learn, obedience to law and willingness to cooperate. Score
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

21. Methods of struggling for existence including
   (a) destructive methods,
   (b) deceptive methods,
   (c) persuasive methods,
   and (d) productive methods.
   These are shown by war, robbery, dueling, sabotage, brawling, thieving, swindling, adulteration of goods, false advertising, courting royal favor, courting the sovereign people, campaigning for office, courtesy, polite social intercourse, truthful advertising, salesmanship,
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per Cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score and the Score
of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

22. The causes of poverty and its alleviation, methods of relief used in this and other countries and the question of national or local responsibility. Score 2 1½ 0 1 1½

23. The development of transportation, communication, trade and commerce. Score 1 1 1 1½ 1½

24. Natural resources; their uses and conservation, including
Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

25. Human relations in business and industry, workers, employers, occupations and service.

Score

26. Occupations, professional and professional services, including material for vocational guidance, preparation for occupations, qualifications of workers, advantages
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1 1/2</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

and disadvantages of various employments presented to awaken in the student the possibilities to be of benefit to himself and to serve to others as well as to instil the idea of dignity of honest work. Score _______ +--l-__ l-l_--l-2--r_l_./2_,

27. Saving, home-ownership, and investments.
Score _______ 1 1 1 1/2 1/2

28. Consideration of economic conditions and movements existing in the past, their failures and successes. Score _______ 1 0 0 0 1/2
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with
the Per Cent of Correlation with
the Possible Score and the Score
of the Four Textbooks Compared.

| 29. Consideration of present conditions, movements, and their possibilities. Score | 30. The qualities of a good American citizen, including health, tolerance, sympathy, justice, responsibilities, culture, use of leisure, large-group consciousness, moral behavior and fellowship, socialized attitudes; social, economic, religious, industrial, and political ideals; and respect for the | SYMBOLS |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | 1 | 1 | 1/2 | 1/2 |
Table III continued

Detailed Criteria for Scoring
Citizenship Textbooks Together with the Per Cent of Correlation with the Possible Score and the Score of the Four Textbooks Compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SYMBOLS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>rights and opinions of others. Score</th>
<th>5 3 3 1 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TOTAL SCORE FOR THE DIVISIONS OF SUBJECT-MATTER CRITERIA (V.B.)</th>
<th>64 48 1/2 42 35 35</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL SCORE FOR ALL CRITERIA FOR (1) MECHANICAL FEATURES, (2) AUTHOR, (3) PUBLISHER, RECENCY OF PUBLICATION AND COST, (4) CONTENT, (5) ORGANIZATION AND PRESENTATION OF SUBJECT-MATTER, AND (6) SUBJECT-MATTER MATERIAL CONTAINED IN THE TEXTBOOK</td>
<td>1000 889.5 728 760 742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CORRELATION OF SCORE WITH POSSIBLE SCORE</td>
<td>100% 88.95% 72.8% 76% 74.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX B

Reasons for the Establishment of a Check-List of Criteria for Scoring Textbooks

1. Evaluated criteria appears to be the common judgment of thoughtful men.

2. By the use of a check-list of criteria the factors which are considered desirable are subdivided into their component elements for comparison with those of the textbook which is considered.

3. The use of prearranged criteria tends to make the analysis more objective and less subjective. Without such criteria there is a tendency for the one judging or comparing the texts to stress material in which he is particularly interested and fail to consider other material of equal importance.

4. The purpose or aim of teaching citizenship may be more easily overlooked unless a list of criteria is used for the analysis of the text. The check-list enables the evaluator of the textbook to keep the points of criteria before him.

5. To avoid snap judgments, local prejudice, and political influence.

6. To reduce the personal element in judgment and to enable
the scorer to keep a record of his judgments at hand.

7. To enable the evaluator of textbooks to compare his judgment with that of another evaluator. Thus, each scorer may correct the meaning that he has attached to the criteria.

The Reasons for Choosing Those Who Were Asked to Evaluate the Check-List

Since the establishment of valid criteria for scoring textbooks in citizenship for high schools is vital to such textbook selection, it seems only natural to ask why the writer chose those whom he asked to evaluate the criteria. To such an inquiry the writer would reply that these were chosen because of their education, experience, positions held, or because of the section of the country in which they live. The criteria for a textbook in citizenship should be considered by competent leaders from several sections of the United States in order that a citizenship text, which is based upon such criteria, may meet the needs of the United States as a whole. Our citizenry is composed of many types, resulting from influences of sectional ideas as well as from national and racial aspirations, tastes, and prejudices. It has been in view of these facts that an attempt has been made to get a cross-section of educational opinion—"the common
judgment of thoughtful men". By consulting the United States Office of Education it was hoped to secure the judgment of national officials in education; by writing to the state departments of education in different sections of the country it was planned to secure some educational opinion from the North, South, East, and West. These sections are plagued by different economic and racial problems which may effect their ideas pertaining to the requirements of a citizenship text. From the East one might expect opinions colored by a conservative perspective; from Mississippi one might expect ideas of citizenship based upon ideals and prejudices of the deep South. From California the investigator hoped to secure ideas of citizenship which have resulted from the progressive atmosphere of the West and from California's oriental problem. Also, California has been ranked as an educational leader for a number of years and has given special emphasis to the study of citizenship.

From the state of Washington one might expect to gather some of its broad, western outlook instilled in its ideas of citizenship requirements, but from New Mexico one might expect its broad perspective to be tempered by drowsy, Spanish influence. We may look to Missouri, Kansas and Nebraska for Mid-western ideals of citizenship although Missouri, perhaps may be considered to lean in
the opposite direction from that which has sometimes been mentioned as the conservative and puritanical influence of Kansas. Moreover the state department of Missouri developed a detailed and carefully prepared course of study a number of years ago and, therefore, might be expected to know the most valuable features of a citizenship text. Life Missouri, the Nebraska state department of education is subject to less frequent changes in personnel than the personnel in some other states.

The National and state teachers associations have been consulted for reasons similar to those for which the national and state departments of education have been considered. They, too, represent different sections, different groups, and different personnel.

The board of education in the District of Columbia and a number of city schools have been consulted because they have made studies in textbook selection or because they have the reputation of being leaders in educational movements.

The majority of the county superintendents of public instruction which were asked to evaluate criteria for scoring textbooks are members of the Kansas Reading Circle Committee or the Kansas advisory committee on textbook adoptions.
The college teachers who were asked to evaluate the criteria are experienced instructors in social science or the heads of their departments. They represent different schools in different sections, and different schools of thought. The high school teachers who were asked to evaluate the criteria are experienced teachers and some are members of the Kansas advisory committee on textbook adoptions.

The publishing companies which were asked to evaluate criteria for scoring textbooks in Citizenship for high schools publish texts in citizenship or other citizenship materials. Their opinions are considered worthwhile because they specialized in the field and their ideas reflect, to some degree, the accepted criteria which has been established through years of publishing experience.

The laymen who have been consulted in regard to the criteria are engaged in different fields. Some are college graduates or have equivalent training; two are high school board members. One of these has been a teacher and a county superintendent. One layman is a minister, and another is a federal commissioner who has been a high school instructor.
Resume Concerning the Replies Received Relative to the Check-List of Criteria

The investigator sent out eighty-two check-lists of criteria for evaluation and received about forty-six replies; however only thirty-nine made contributions or scored the check-list.

Seven of the evaluated check-lists or other contributions were from the office of city superintendents and a high school principal in the District of Columbia. One of these was from the office of the city superintendent in Leavenworth, Kansas, and another consisted of a score card, carrying a notation, from Des Moines. Another reply consisted of a check-list and other information from the Salina, Kansas high school; the fourth was the evaluation of the check-list by the principal of Eastern High School, District of Columbia, for the Board of Education; the fifth was an evaluation of the check-list by R. L. Wells of the Bismarck North Dakota schools, for the city superintendent; the sixth consisted of an evaluation by the superintendent of schools in Belen, New Mexico; and the seventh was an evaluation by R. R. John, Assistant Director of Personnel in the Los Angeles school system, who is also a former high school instructor and principal.

The Des Moines score card was "A Score Card For
Judging Value of Business Organization Texts. It consisted of eight mimeographed sheets. Like the check-list of criteria which had been previously established by the writer, the Des Moines score card was divided into five major divisions and subdivided into several more. The main divisions of the Des Moines score card were (1) interest, (2) comprehension, (3) scope and permanent value of subject matter, and (4) mechanical elements.

The Salina, Kansas high school sent a sheet relative to "The Selection of Classroom Textbooks" and a check-list of criteria which is known as, "Objective Comparison of Textbooks". The check-list was evaluated upon the basis of eighty-nine possible points. "The Selection of Classroom Textbooks" contains information relative to factual materials necessary for a textbook. Also, it contains material relative to the organization of a text, including style, teaching helps, physical aspects, and procedure for judging a textbook. The first sentence is significant: "The vast supply of textbooks makes it imperative that teachers develop a technique in evaluating the classroom text". Salina's "Objective Comparison of Textbooks" does not take the publisher into account.

The investigators check-list of criteria was
evaluated upon a basis of one hundred per cent of Charles Hart, Principal of the Eastern High School, District of Columbia; but his score may be interpreted into a score upon the basis of one thousand points. Of the writer's check-list he says, in part, "In a general way, however, we would assign the following values to each of the five main headings": I. Mechanical features, 10%; II. Author, 5%; III. Publisher, recency of publication, and cost to student, 10%; IV. Content, 35%; V-A. Organization and presentation of subject matter, 30%; and V-B. Other materials, 10%. It is interesting to note that the investigator's findings reveal a similarity between Principal Hart's evaluation and the average of group average scores. The average score of group averages are: (1) Mechanical features, 13.1%; (2) Author, 11.3%; (3) Publisher, recency of publication and cost to students, 11%; (4) Content, 30.1%; (V-A) organization and presentation of subject matter, 27.4%; (V-B) Other materials, 6.4%.

Mr. A. B. Calloway, principal of the junior high school of Dodge City, Kansas, and a member of the Kansas advisory committee on textbook adoptions, scored the investigator's check-list of criteria and listed eight points that he considered when evaluating a text.

Mr. Ivan R. Waterman, Chief of the Division of
Textbooks and Publications, California State Department of Education, says in part"...The set of criteria appears to include all, or certainly most of the important items that should be considered in judging the relative merits of citizenship textbooks. In my opinion this detail is highly essential for adequate evaluation."

He suggests that certain items might be combined and that certain sections might be less detailed. Also, he mentions that, in the textbook evaluation which is being carried on by the State Department of Education in California, neither the author nor publisher are considered separately. Moreover he says: "...cost is not included in any of our criteria, but considered after the relative educational merits of all books have been determined."

Other reactions to the investigator's check-list of criteria were as follows: One county superintendent referred it to a social science teacher; a high school board member, who has been a county superintendent and teacher, referred the check-list to a teacher of government, and a publishing company referred the writer to a curriculum advisor of a city school system. The director of secondary education in a certain state answered, in part: "We have no state textbook law and every school is a power unto itself in selecting textbooks. Of course they must be up to standard as far as high
school texts are concerned, but we have no number of textbooks". He did not suggest what "up to standard" might include.

Another reply, from a state high school supervisor, states: "It would be difficult for us to score the relative value of the mechanical and other features of a textbook. Such work is referred to experienced judges and publishers and to individuals and groups who have training and experience along this line..."

The investigator also received a pamphlet containing a list of all textbooks purchased by the city schools of one of our major cities, but it presented no criteria for the evaluation of texts.

From this survey it was found that, as a whole, high school teachers evaluated the check-list more readily than others and laymen least readily of all.

Inquiries Concerning Comparative Studies of Textbooks in Citizenship for High Schools

After finding several references to comparative studies of textbooks in civics and community civics (see Studies in Civics Textbooks, Chapter I), the investigator wrote to the Graduate Council of twenty-five state universities or colleges to inquire if any of their students had ever made a comparative study of textbooks
in citizenship for high schools. He received thirteen replies and found that no such study had been made; however he found that four comparative studies of textbooks in civics or community civics had been made in thirteen institutions. No candidate for an advanced degree has made a comparative study of textbooks in citizenship for high schools in the following colleges and Universities: Kansas State College, Manhattan, Kansas; Notre Dame, Notre Dame, Indiana; University of Missouri, Columbia; George Peabody College, Nashville, Tennessee; John Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland; University of Minnesota, Minnesota; University of Colorado, Boulder; University of Nebraska, Lincoln; Teachers College, Columbia University, New York; University of New Mexico, Albuquerque.

Publishers of Citizenship Texts

As a part of his preparation for the selection and comparison of textbooks in citizenship, the writer wrote to thirty-four publishing companies for textbooks, together with workbooks and teachers' manuals for use with the texts. He found that twenty-six publishers did not publish textbooks in citizenship although two of the twenty-six published excellent study outlines or other supplementary material. Two of the ten publishers, who
published textbooks in citizenship or other citizenship material, publish workbooks and teachers manuals; one publishes a workbook, a teacher's manual, and a supplementary booklet to be used with or without a text; two publish excellent supplementary booklets; and it appears that the remaining five publish a textbook without a workbook. The following companies provided textbooks or citizenship material or both for study: Allyn and Bacon, American Book Company, American Education Press, Columbus, Ohio; Ginn and Company, D. C. Heath and Company, Laidlaw Brothers, Macmillan Company, McGraw-Hill Book Company, New York; McKinley Publishing Company, Philadelphia; and Benj. H. Sanborn and Company.
Appendix C

The Evaluators of the Check-List

The following evaluated the investigator's check-list or criteria or sent suggestions, check-lists, or gave other assistance in this study: Dr. Segel, Educational Committant, United States Office of Education, Washington, D. C.; Principal Charles Hart, Principal of the Eastern High School of the District of Columbia; Ivan R. Waterman, Chief of Division of Textbooks and Publications, California State Department of Education, Sacramento; R. R. John, Assistant Director of Personnel, Los Angeles City Schools; Carl S. Wilson, Instructor of Political Science, Lincoln Junior College, Wesson, Mississippi; B. A. Stevens, Assistant Secretary for Research, Ohio Education Association, Columbus; the New Mexico State Department of Education, Santa Fe; the Missouri State Department of Education, Jefferson City; the Minnesota State Department of Education, St. Paul; R. L. Wells of the Bismarck, North Dakota schools for the city superintendent; Bessie Bacon Goodrich, Curriculum Advisor of Des Moines, Iowa, who sent a score card; Bernice Dainard Gestie, Managing Editor, Minnesota Education Association Magazine, St. Paul; Ira J. Bright, Superintendent of Schools, Leavenworth, Kansas;
J. E. Stonecipher, Des Moines Public Schools, Des Moines, Iowa; the office of the City Superintendent of Schools, Salina, Kansas; Clyde King of Phillipsburg, Kansas, a former county superintendent of Phillips county; Howard O. Stone, County Superintendent of Schools, Westmoreland, Kansas; Professor of Political Science, Kansas University, Lawrence; Nora B. Cummings, Western Washington College of Education, Bellingham, Washington; Randall C. Hill, Professor of Sociology, Kansas State College, Manhattan, Kansas; A. B. Calloway, Principal of the Junior High School, and a member of the Kansas advisory social science committee on textbook adoptions, Dodge City, Kansas; Mrs. Helen Mauck of the Junction City schools, and a member of the Kansas advisory committee on textbook adoptions, Junction City, Kansas; G. W. Webster, Hays High School, Hays, Kansas; Steva Pearl James, Howard High School, Howard, Kansas; Mark Pedigo, Principal of the Junior High School, Neosho Falls, Kansas; Superintendent W. H. Hukriede, Superintendent of Schools, Lewis, Kansas; Ida M. Veverka, Niles High School, Niles, Kansas; Principal of the Abbyville High School, Abbyville, Kansas; J. L. Gill, Superintendent of Schools, Belen, New Mexico; Gladys Harter, Douglas High School, Douglas, Kansas; Herbert T. Ayers, Huron High School, Huron, Kansas the American education Press, Columbus, Ohio; F. W. Bunalle of
Laidlaw Brothers, Chicago; W. R. Collins of the Macmillan Book Company, Chicago; the D. C. Heath Book Company, Chicago; Walter Ryan of the American Book Company, Chicago; W. H. Myers and Milton L. Johnson of the Bendena State Bank, Bendena, Kansas; Maurice Pope, Federal Commissioner, St. Joseph, Missouri; the Reverend Joseph W. Peterson, Belen, New Mexico; J. A. Neely, a former county superintendent and a member of a high school board, Niles, Kansas; and John Beedy, member of the Agra High School board, Agra, Kansas.

This deals with a survey to find which states publish textbooks, or have published textbooks, and some of the reasons for state publication.


This is a pioneer study in the field of the scientific evaluation of textbooks. It is an experiment in cooperative evaluation of Junior high school mathematics texts in which over forty teachers of the Los Angeles school system took part. It explains the whole procedure of the evaluation.


Pages 406-418 of this book contain information relative to investigations which were made to find the length of line most easily read and the proper size and proportion of type.

The author shows some criteria which have been used for the evaluation and selection of textbooks, but which are not valid.


This shows the lack of careful evaluation of textbooks preceding their selection.


This chapter deals with the use of a score card for the evaluation of textbooks.

Rader, W. L. Scientific Selection of School Texts. (In National Education Association. Department of

A report concerning the selection of school texts by scientific methods.


This is a study of the authors who have written our texts beginning with 1876. It considers the following: Who are the authors of textbooks in the United States? What are their occupations? What places do they hold in the educational world?

Magazine Articles and Pamphlets


The article discusses the development of the selection of textbooks. It includes the competition between publishers, "free exchange", "free samples", and the further development of textbook selection.


This article deals with the necessity for, and
the method of, textbook evaluation prior to the selection of the text.


The article refers to the evaluation of high school textbooks. He feels that certain criteria which have been used as a basis for the selection of texts are not valid. Also, he presents criteria that he thinks are valid.


This is an article relative to the evaluation and selection of textbooks.


The article classifies criteria into general and specific criteria. It considers content, reading difficulty, interest appeal and development of subject-matter in considerable detail.

Lively, Bertha, and Pressey, S. L. A Method for Measuring the Vocabulary Burden Or Textbooks. (In Elementary
An article relative to the evaluation of textbooks.


An article relative to the evaluation of textbooks before adoption for use.


The article states that the teaching of morality is a paramount aim in education.


The authors point to certain criteria which have been considered valid, but which are of little value.


This article deals with the evaluation and selection of textbooks in the Chicago Public Schools.

This article deals with the method of selecting textbooks in elementary schools.


An article stressing the necessity for scientific investigations in the field of textbook evaluation and selection.


This is another article dealing with the necessity for the evaluation of textbooks before selection.

Wyman, William T. The Selection of Textbooks for Vocational Schools. (In Industrial Arts and Vocational Education. V. 21, p. 285-289, Oct., 1932.)

An article which shows that the subject matter should explain actual life situations with which the student is familiar, that subject matter should give basic principles and applications, that new-type tests or a workbook should be provided, that units of textbooks should be divided into sections, and other requirements of textbooks.
Findings from Theses Represented by
the following:

Cobb, J. L. A Comparison of the Content Material of
Civics Texts with the Aims of Education. Urbana,

An analysis of the content material of six
civics texts to find the amount of space given to
the different divisions of the local, state, and
national units of government. The material is
compared with the objectives laid down by modern
educators.

Greenwalt, William Carl. A Technique for Study of Ninth
Grade Civics. Madison, University of Wisconsin,

This shows how to set up criteria from books,
articles relating to the subject, and from the
examination of textbooks.

Herriott, M. E., Fuller, Florence D., and Nettles, Charles
H. Textbook Adoption and Evaluation Procedures.
Los Angeles Secondary Schools. (In Los Angeles
Oct., 1930.)

The purpose of this study was to develop
adequate adoption and evaluation procedure and to
secure the best textbooks available in such subjects
as science, mathematics, home economics etc.

The author made an analysis of six texts and based his criteria upon twelve studies. The aims of United States history were determined by the study of general literature, prefaces of textbooks, and courses of study. His findings are that, since the texts omit industrial and political problems of the day and the content is not always conducive to reflection and critical thought, the textbooks are not likely to contribute in the most desirable way to the complete realization of the aims.


The study includes the functions of textbooks; principles of textbook selection; purpose, approach, sequence of topics; spatial allotment; terminology; exercise; illustrations; age to pupils. Findings: Emphasis is placed upon bookkeeping as an educational instrument; balance-sheet approach; terminology is uniform; there is a wide variation spatial allotments; plenty of exercise material; simple language. Eight textbooks that are used in the New York City school system were studies and an attempt was made to set up some principles that should guide one in selecting textbooks.

A study was made of the collection of typewriting texts in the office of the department of business education, New York University. All the texts published since 1926 were examined to see if they fulfilled the following qualifications: (1) Tests designed for use in senior high schools, (2) those that have as their objectives the training of typists in the fundamentals of accurate typing, (3) those that try to familiarize the students with common business forms and practices, (4) those that allow a maximum of two years as a training period.


The thesis deals with current methods as well as ideal methods of selecting elementary and high school textbooks. The author made a study of books and articles on the subject as well as a study of replies received to a questionnaire which was sent to three hundred cities in the United States with a population to 10,000 inhabitants. Separate consideration was given to four major requirements of textbooks. Findings indicate that the text should be selected by the teachers who will use them, working in cooperation with the supervisors.


The study was made to determine the extent to which the illustrations found in the texts were made use of by the authors in their presentation of the subject matter. Also, the following problems were discussed: The portion of the book space given to illustrative material, the size of illustrations, the position that the illustrations occupied on the
page, the relation between the illustrations and the content of the text, the placement of illustrations relative to textbook matter which referred directly or indirectly to them, the relation between the illustration and its caption and the various kinds of illustrations. Findings reveal little regularity as to size of illustrations. Findings reveal little regularity as to size of illustrations and a lack of direct connection between illustrations and subject matter.